REVIEW



Strategies to achieve effective nitrogen activation

Bin Chang^{1,2} | Huabin Zhang¹ | Shuhui Sun² | Gaixia Zhang³

¹KAUST Catalysis Center (KCC), King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST), Thuwal, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia ²Institut National de la Recherche Scientifique (INRS), Centre Énergie Matériaux Télécommunications, Varennes, Québec, Canada ³Department of Electrical Engineering, École de Technologie Supérieure (ÉTS), Montréal, Québec, Canada

Correspondence

Huabin Zhang, KAUST Catalysis Center (KCC), King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST), Thuwal 23955-6900, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. Email: Huabin.Zhang@kaust.edu.sa

Shuhui Sun, Institut National de la Recherche Scientifique (INRS), Centre Énergie Matériaux Télécommunications, Varennes, QC J3X 1P7, Canada. Email: shuhui.sun@inrs.ca

Gaixia Zhang, Department of Electrical Engineering, École de Technologie Supérieure (ÉTS), Montréal, QC H3C 1K3, Canada.

Email: gaixia.zhang@etsmtl.ca

Funding information

Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC); Fonds de Recherche du Québec-Nature et Technologies (FRQNT); Centre Québécois sur les Materiaux Fonctionnels (CQMF); Institut National de la Recherche Scientifique (INRS); École de Technologie Supérieure (ÉTS); King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST)

Abstract

Ammonia serves as a crucial chemical raw material and hydrogen energy carrier. Aqueous electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction reaction (NRR), powered by renewable energy, has attracted tremendous interest during the past few years. Although some achievements have been revealed in aqueous NRR, significant challenges have also been identified. The activity and selectivity are fundamentally limited by nitrogen activation and competitive hydrogen evolution. This review focuses on the hurdles of nitrogen activation and delves into complementary strategies, including materials design and system optimization (reactor, electrolyte, and mediator). Then, it introduces advanced interdisciplinary technologies that have recently emerged for nitrogen activation using high-energy physics such as plasma and triboelectrification. With a better understanding of the corresponding reaction mechanisms in the coming years, these technologies have the potential to be extended in further applications. This review provides further insight into the reaction mechanisms of selectivity and stability of different reaction systems. We then recommend a rigorous and detailed protocol for investigating NRR performance and also highlight several potential research directions in this exciting field, coupling with advanced interdisciplinary applications, in situ/operando characterizations, and theoretical calculations.

KEYWORDS

activation via mediators, catalyst optimization, electrochemical nitrogen fixation, highenergy activation of nitrogen, nitrogen

1 | INTRODUCTION

1.1 | Electrochemical nitrogen reduction

Ammonia (NH₃) plays a crucial role as a fundamental chemical raw material related to the national economy and

people's livelihood, with widespread utilization in various fields, including fertilizers, environmental protection, military, and refrigeration.^{1,2} Meanwhile, NH₃ with high volumetric energy density (13.6 MJ L^{-1}) has significant advantages as an efficient hydrogen storage medium. Specifically, 1.0 L of liquid NH₃ equals 4.9 L of high-pressure hydrogen (35.0 MPa) or 1200 L of standard

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

© 2024 The Authors. Carbon Energy published by Wenzhou University and John Wiley & Sons Australia, Ltd.

temperature and pressure hydrogen.³ Herein, NH₃ is poised to address the challenges of hydrogen energy development. Despite having a development history of over a 100 years, the Haber–Bosch process is still the traditional and efficient method for producing NH₃. The Haber–Bosch process is currently highly inefficient, consuming nearly 3% of the world's annual energy.^{4,5} To achieve the desired yield of NH₃ synthesis, the N≡N bond activation difficult to achieve requires operating at high pressure and temperatures, which increases capital costs and decreases equilibrium conversion. These negative impacts have motivated researchers to explore alternative approaches for small molecular activation and fixation.^{6–11}

With the rapid development of renewable energy technology, such as photovoltaics, wind power, and hydropower, the electrochemical synthesis of NH₃ has emerged as an excellent "zero carbon" circular economy route.¹²⁻¹⁹ According to thermodynamics, the electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction (NRR) into NH₃ is about 20% more energy-efficient than the Haber-Bosch process. The advantages of low-cost, long-distance storage and transportation across regions based on electrochemically synthesized NH₃ are combined with the prosperous downstream hydrogen industry.²⁰⁻²² Unlike the huge dependence on the natural gas feedstock of the Haber-Bosch process, the electrochemical process can avoid using fossil fuels as hydrogen and energy sources by using water molecules as hydrogen sources and combining them with renewable energy technologies. Currently, the most effective strategy for synthesizing "green NH₃" is to replace steam reforming units by coupling electrocatalytic water splitting and

traditional Haber–Bosch reactors (Figure 1).^{23–25} This approach has been preliminarily verified on a large scale globally. Exploring and developing the coupling technology of renewable energy electrolysis to synthesize NH₃ can achieve the absorption and peak shaving of renewable energy electricity while achieving enormous advantages in modularity, scalability, and on-demand small-scale production. Such small synthetic NH₃ facilities utilizing renewable energy can achieve decentralized production of NH₃ and significantly reduce the cost of NH₃ demand in remote areas.

In general, electrocatalytic NRR mechanisms mainly include association and dissociation mechanisms (Figure 2).^{26–31} The dissociation mechanism involves the direct cleavage of N≡N bonds before adsorption, allowing the two adsorbed nitrogen atoms to independently participate in NH₃ synthesis. In contrast, in the association mechanism, N₂ binds to the surface sites of the catalyst, and the bonding between the two nitrogen atoms is not disrupted during the hydrogenation process (forming an N_2H_x intermediate). In this terminal coordination reaction, two hydrogenation processes exist: the distal, alternating (monoadsorbed mode) pathway and the enzymatic (dualadsorbed mode) pathway. In the monoadsorbed mode, the end-on adsorbed nitrogen atoms undergo sequential hydrogenation to form NH3 molecules. For side-on coordinated adsorption pathways, resembling enzymatic pathways, heterogeneous electrocatalysts encounter challenges in achieving bidentate coordination of dinitrogen groups. The design of dual-coordinate electrocatalysts based on mild enzymatic pathway holds great promise. Finally,



FIGURE 1 Scheme of electrochemical nitrogen reduction for "green ammonia" synthesis.



FIGURE 2 Generic mechanisms for electrochemical nitrogen reduction on heterogeneous catalysts.

the reaction pathways on transition metal nitrides predominantly adhere to the Mars–van Krevelen mechanism.^{32,33} The initial NH₃ molecule arises from the reduction of lattice nitrogen atoms within transition metal nitrides, subsequently replenishing lattice nitrogen through fusion with gaseous nitrogen molecules. The resulting nitrogen vacancies serve as a continuous avenue for nitrogen adsorption and subsequent reactions. Regardless of the above mechanisms, the lone pair electrons, strong N≡N bond, and high ionization energy (15.58 eV) of N₂ inhibit the subsequent hydrogenation reaction. For electrochemical NRR, the activation of nitrogen is the greatest challenge.

1.2 | Bottleneck of nitrogen activation

To date, the main challenge of NH_3 synthesis is the activation of nitrogen molecules which have an extremely strong $N\equiv N$ bond with large bonding energy (945 kJ mol⁻¹). In nature, iron–molybdenum enzymes (nitrogenase) can achieve nitrogen activation through iron–sulfur clusters with terminal molybdenum atoms:

$$N_{2} + 16 \text{ ATP} + 8 \text{ H}^{+} + 8 \text{ e}^{-} \rightarrow 2 \text{ NH}_{3} + 16 \text{ ADP} + \text{H}_{2} + 16 \text{ H}_{x} \text{PO}_{4}^{n-},$$
(1)

where ATP and ADP represent adenosine triphosphate and adenosine diphosphate, respectively (Equation 1). $^{34-36}$ The mechanism of nitrogen activation is believed to be the coordination of N₂ molecules with the terminal metal center of FeMo nitrogenase. However, there is still controversy over whether the subsequent hydrogenation process is carried out through the distal or association pathways.^{37–40} It is worth noting that the energy consumption for the entire reaction of NH₃ synthesis is 244 kJ mol^{-1} of NH₃. The enzyme-based aqueous NH₃ synthesis at room temperature and ambient pressure has high energy efficiency, which prompted people to simulate chemical materials with similar structures in subsequent research to achieve efficient nitrogen activation, thereby achieving large-scale NH₃ synthesis.41-43

As such, mild electrochemical NH_3 synthesis has become an important technology for simulating biological NH_3 synthesis, replacing the Haber–Bosch process.^{44–46} It is attractive that the electrochemical system directly achieves nitrogen and proton activation through nitrogen and water.

$$N_2 + 6 H^+ + 6 e^- \rightarrow 2 NH_3, E^0 = 0.148 V.$$
 (2)

$$2H^+ + 2e^- \rightarrow H_2, E^0 = 0 V.$$
 (3)



$$2 H_2O + 2 e^- \rightarrow 2 H_2 + 2OH^-, E^0 = -0.828 V.$$
 (5)

(4)

The above chemical equations show that the equilibrium potentials of hydrogen evolution reaction (HER) and NRR are similar in alkaline and acidic electrolytes (Equations 2-5).47-49 In the NRR process, the primary competitive side reaction is HER. Most H₂O or hydrogen protons in the electrochemical system tend to be reduced into H₂ rather than NH₃, leading to serious selectivity issues. Meanwhile, the improvement of NRR selectivity is also limited by another challenge: achieving efficient nitrogen activation. For electrode materials, the regulation of active ingredients, crystal structure, and surface that strongly bind with N-H intermediates and H* all contribute to suppressing HER and improving NRR efficiency.⁵⁰⁻⁵³ Meanwhile, as an indispensable reaction medium, electrolytes with considerable N₂ solubility and limited proton transfer ability can effectively enhance N2 adsorption and activation.54-57

This review discusses the critical research efforts on nitrogen activation, including electrocatalyst design, reaction system optimization, and nitrogen preactivation (Figure 3). A basic understanding of the roles of material structure (electrocatalysts) and local catalytic environment (introduction of Li or enzyme mediators) in nitrogen adsorption and activation will ultimately lead to the design and development of better electrochemical NH₃ synthesis systems. Moreover, N₂ can be converted into easily reducible nitrogen oxides by high-energy physics particles. This innovative nitrogen pre-activation approach can significantly improve the efficiency of NH₃ synthesis. Therefore, this review provides potential and effective insights for N₂ activation in electrochemical heterogeneous NH₃ synthesis.

CHANG ET AL.

2 | THE OPTIMIZATION OF THE REACTION SYSTEM

Motivated by the rapid development of sustainable electricity and the advantages of electrochemical synthesis, environmental electrochemical NRR has attracted growing interest. So far, some effective strategies for promoting NRR catalytic performance have also been introduced to improve reaction systems, such as doping, defects, interface engineering of electrocatalysts, electrolyte optimization, and novel electrolytic cell designing.^{58–66} Meanwhile, various nanomaterials have been designed as the potential NRR electrocatalysts (Figure 4), including metal alloys, single atoms, transition metal



FIGURE 3 Scheme of nitrogen activation for NH₃ synthesis.



FIGURE 4 Performance map of the reported NRR electrocatalysts. Updated until July 12, 2023.

boride/carbides/nitride/oxide/sulfides, metal-free materials, and hybrids.^{67–76} Although significant progress has been made in the short term, this research field is undoubtedly still facing various problems, which are challenged by the intrinsic limitations of reactions.^{77,78} First, the overlap between the NRR work potential window and HER results in HER side reactions often dominating the hydrogenation process. The low solubility of N₂ in the water further limits the NRR performance. Second, although numerous NRR works have been conducted, the NH₃ yield of an aqueous NRR system is still relatively low (µmol level), which is highly susceptible to the influence of NH_3 and NO_r in the laboratory environment. The long-standing consensus is that rigorous validation experiments are needed to determine the nitrogen source in the NH₃ product. The materials, electrolytes, and gases currently used in the NRR field may affect the quantitative NH_3 yield. Therefore, ${}^{15}N_2$ isotope experiments are an essential part of NRR experiments.^{79,80} From a catalytic perspective, the cyclic synthesis of NH₃ via aqueous NRR should be performed more than 10 times, and there should be a linear relationship between the reaction time and the number of cycles. Moreover, easily overlooked key experimental parameters, such as gas flow rate, electrolyte volume, and sampling methods, still require thorough investigations of the impact on NRR activity and selectivity.

Although the aqueous NRR system still faces many challenges, its advantages of mild and environmentally friendly NH₃ synthesis make us more willing to consider it an insurmountable difficulty. To balance efficiency and accuracy, we recommend a rigorous protocol for daily NRR experiments (Figure 5).

1) Conducting NRR experiments requires a clear and detailed description of the experimental protocols and details, such as the purity of chemical reagents and source gases, the exclusion of nitrogen sources during

material synthesis, electrolytic cell design and electrochemical measurements, control experiments, cyclic tests, and various NH₃ detecting methods.

- 2) Excluding external nitrogen sources from materials, gases, and the reaction system is necessary to eliminate false positive results. Additionally, more accurate and rigorous results for NRR can be obtained through stable yield-time linear relationships.
- 3) Defining the calculation methods for NH₃ yield and Faraday efficiency (FE) is crucial. It is recommended to provide raw data on current density, ultraviolet-visible absorption spectra or NMR spectra, NH₃ yield, and FE for the control experiments at different atmospheres and other control conditions.

Metal-based catalyst 2.1

Electrochemical NRR mainly involves three steps: nitrogen adsorption, cleavage, and hydrogenation. The sluggish kinetics of nitrogen activation has always been an important barrier limiting subsequent reactions. The d-orbital electrons of the transition-metal-based materials can achieve π backdonation effects, thereby alleviating the kinetic problems of N≡N bond activation.^{29,81–84} Meanwhile, the excellent proton activation ability of noble metals and several transition metal-based materials can provide sufficient proton sources for subsequent nitrogen hydrogenation steps.⁸⁵⁻⁸⁸ This provides an extensive basis for material selection for the following material design.

As the leader of various catalysts, noble metals have good conductivity, polycrystalline surfaces with rich active sites, and the ability to combine with different reaction intermediates.^{89–92} They also exhibit excellent catalytic potential in electrochemical NRR. Bao et al.93 synthesized tetrahexahedral Au nanorods via a seeded growth approach. This as-synthesized Au catalyst achieved the maximum NH₃



FIGURE 5 Recommended experimental protocol to rigorously conduct NRR research.

yield of 1.648 mg h⁻¹ cm⁻² with FE of 4.02% and by-product hydrazine yield of 0.102 mg h⁻¹ cm⁻². Although the above reaction efficiency and selectivity need to be improved, starting with this classic work of Au, various noble metals are gradually stepping onto the electrocatalytic NRR. Considering the ability to break through the reaction barrier and rich surface-active sites on ruthenium, rhodium, and other noble metals, various strategies, including single atom designing, alloying, morphological controlling, and surface/ interface engineering, can be introduced to enhance the NRR performance of metal-based materials.^{94–99}

The ideal NRR electrocatalyst requires excellent N₂ activation ability and suitable proton transfer ability. For transition metal-based hybrid materials, the metal *d* states and *s* states of main group elements induce *sp* hybridized states on the surface.^{100–102} The excess occupied orbitals of transition metal induce the backdonation of electrons to the π -antibonding orbitals of N₂, thereby achieving N₂ cleavage. Meanwhile, based on the Lewis acid–base theory, nitrogen molecules with lone pair electrons belong to Lewis bases, while noble metals are Lewis acids.^{103,104} Introducing noble metal sites on transition metal hybrids can theoretically achieve efficient and highly selective N₂ adsorption and cleavage. Computational study suggests that transition metal carbides (the d^2 , d^3 , and d^4 series) are promising for nitrogen

capture and reduction. Chemisorbed nitrogen on transition metal carbides can elongate/weaken the N≡N triple bond, thus promoting its catalytic conversion into NH₃. Bin et al.¹⁰⁵ proposed an efficient laser-tuning strategy for constructing a series of noble-metal Lewis acid sites on the molybdenum carbide (Figure 6A). They imparted the Lewis acid character of noble metal on adjacent molybdenum sites with empty orbitals, yielding an outstanding NRR system by mimicking π backdonation. The laser-tuned noble metal sites achieved effective N2 cleavage, lower thermodynamic energy barrier, and optimized N_xH_y migration pathway. The as-synthesized Rh-Mo2C achieves an excellent NH3 yield rate of $26.3 \,\mu\text{g}\,\text{h}^{-1}\,\text{cm}^{-2}$ and FE of 15.4% in the neutral electrolytes. This general laser-tuning strategy guides the interface/surface engineering of active materials for promoting π backdonation.

Numerous metal materials exhibit specific NRR capabilities, but nitrogen activation and competitive hydrogen evolution are still the bottlenecks that limit the further improvement of NRR. Taking transition metal oxides (TMOs) as examples, they are considered potential NRR materials owing to the inappropriate hydrogen adsorption energy.^{109–111} Although TMOs can regulate subsequent hydrogen adsorption steps, their electronrich surface limits nitrogen adsorption in the first step.



FIGURE 6 (A) Illustration of the laser-tuned concept for mimicking π backdonation. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2023, Elsevier.¹⁰⁵ (B) Illustration of magnetron sputtering tuned active sites on transition-metal oxides. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2022, the Royal Society of Chemistry.¹⁰⁶ (C) Illustration of laser-constructed S vacancy on CoS_x NRR electrocatalyst. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2023, the Royal Society of Chemistry.¹⁰⁷ (D) Three-dimensional topographic potential distribution images of N₂ absorbed onto different samples. (E) Variation trends observed in the configurations of LUMO of free N₂ and of N₂ absorbed onto Fe–MoS₂. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2022, Elsevier.¹⁰⁸

Chang et al.¹¹² utilized the advantages of excellent conductivity and strong chemical stability characteristics of transition metal nitrides to construct an oxynitride layer structure on the surface of TMOs. The oxynitride layer possesses additional metal valence states, which are conducive to the N₂ absorption and activation with the lone-pair electrons. The as-synthesized TMOs with oxynitride layer exhibit enhanced neutral NRR activity with a yield of $6.78 \,\mu g \, h^{-1} \, cm^{-2}$ and FE of 5.6%. This chemical method to efficiently control the electronic structure of materials still needs further improvement. Meanwhile, introducing nitrides obscures the nitrogen traceability of NH₃ synthesis, and the corresponding NRR mechanisms are too complex to achieve clear investigation.^{113,114} Herein, Zhao et al.^{106,107} used highenergy physics methods such as magnetron sputtering and laser to accurately control the surface vacancy of

TMOs and sulfides, thus improving the NRR activity. The introduction of magnetron sputtering synchronously realizes the regulation of the metal valence state and oxygen vacancy (Figure 6B).¹⁰⁶ The unique electronic structure with occupied and vacant orbitals at the metal atoms significantly promotes π backdonation. After magnetron sputtering of NiO, the NRR performance of pure TiO₂ substrate has significantly improved to $10.75 \,\mu g h^{-1} cm^{-2}$, which is seven times that of pure TiO₂. Similarly, metal sulfides have also been regarded as potential electrocatalysts due to the "accept and backdonate" interaction of metals with nitrogen. Defect and interface engineering are efficient strategies for promoting the intrinsic and extrinsic catalytic activity of metal sulfides. Zhao et al.¹⁰⁷ achieved promoted NRR activity on CoS_x with a yield of $12.2 \,\mu g \, h^{-1} \, cm^{-2}$ by via laser to tune the sulfur vacancies on the material surface

(Figure 6C). The above works have confirmed the feasibility of controlling the π backdonation sites by physical approaches, which show great potential in modifying transition metal materials.

Single-atom catalysts are widely investigated owing to their ability to achieve efficient atomic utilization and excellent ability.^{115–120} The type of central metal species, electron configuration, and surrounding coordination environment affect their geometric and electronic structure, so these parameters control allows to tune the reaction pathways of electrochemical NRR.¹²¹⁻¹²⁴ Ma et al.¹²⁵ designed a synergistic strategy in the synthesis of Mo single-atom electrocatalyst coupling with Mo₂C nanoparticles anchored on carbon nanotube. The assynthesized material exhibited excellent acidic NRR performance with an NH₃ yield of 16.1 μ g h⁻¹ cm⁻² and FE of 7.1%. To further improve the utilization rate of single atoms, Li et al.¹⁰⁸ combined single-atom catalysts with two-dimensional materials to excite extreme electric fields and achieve nitrogen repolarization. The heterojunction interfaces are conducive to the formation of high curvature interfacial protrusion shapes so as to fully utilize each interface atom to achieve maximum stimulation of extreme electric fields (Figure 6D). The introduction of Fe single-atom greatly increases the extreme electric field of monolayer molybdenum disulfide. The enhanced electric field polarizes N₂ to trigger interface polarization, which significantly promotes electron injection back into N₂ (Figure 6E), thereby achieving efficient NRR with the NH₃ yield of 36.1 mg h^{-1} g⁻¹ and FE of 31.6%. The coupling strategy of curvature-rich surface and single atom-triggered interface polarization can effectively achieve N₂ activation. This strong polarization design concept lays the foundation for future innovation in electrochemical NH₃ synthesis.

The investigations on two-dimensional transition metal carbides (MXene) in the field of electrochemical NRR are rapidly proceeding.^{126,127} Theoretically, pristine MXene possesses excellent nitrogen gas adsorption capability. Among various material models, the nitrogen hydrogenation step on Mo₂TiC₂ demonstrates thermodynamic feasibility.¹²⁸ Simultaneously, the high hydrogen evolution free energy limits the hydrogen evolution side reaction at Mo active sites, potentially leading to enhanced FE. However, in experiments, pure MXene did not exhibit the expected outstanding NH₃ yield and FE as predicted by theory.^{129,130} MXene differs from the theoretical pure carbide model due to the limitations in nitrogen adsorption and activation. Therefore, researchers have explored a series of surface modification and construction methods for MXene hybrids to overcome the energy barriers in the reaction rate determination step

(nitrogen activation or nitrogen hydrogenation).¹³¹⁻¹³⁵ The fine-tuning of the micro/nanostructure and electronic configuration through inorganic and polymer modification or heteroelement doping collectively creates a favorable environment for nitrogen adsorption. Additionally, MXene functions as a platform for hosting active sites, including single atoms, atomic clusters, and heterogeneous junctions. Guided by the earlier optimization strategies, highly unsaturated metal single-atom sites dispersed on MXene exhibit excellent activity. The strong interaction between the single atom and MXene can effectively anchor the single atoms and prevent aggregation. Peng et al.¹³⁶ have innovatively designed singleatomic ruthenium-modified Mo₂CT_x MXene nanosheets as an efficient electrocatalyst for nitrogen fixation at ambient conditions. Single-atomic Ru anchored on MXene nanosheets plays a pivotal role as essential electron backdonation centers for N2 activation, which can not only promote nitrogen adsorption and activation behavior of the catalyst but also reduce the thermodynamic energy barrier of the initial hydrogenation step.

To sum up, noble metal-based materials typically exhibit excellent catalytic activity, while high cost and limited resources hinder the practical applications. The NRR catalytic performance of TMOs has been widely studied and confirmed, but their stability is relatively poor under negative potential conditions. Other transition metal-based materials, including sulfides, carbides, and phosphides, may be worth more explorations. Although theoretical studies have demonstrated the potential of transition metal nitrides as NRR catalysts based on the Mars-van Krevelen mechanism, the experimental research on nitride catalysts is still limited, mainly due to N vacancy poisoning and catalyst decomposition during the reaction process. It is necessary to construct more efficient and stable nitrides in suitable reaction systems to achieve excellent NRR performance. As a promising NRR catalyst, single-atom catalysts require further research to broaden the range of dispersed metal atoms from noble metals to transition metals. Moreover, metal-organic framework (MOF) or MOF-derived materials with highly porous structure and multiple catalytic active sites are considered to have promising prospects in the electrochemical conversion of nitrogen to NH₃.

2.2 | Metal-free catalysts

Transition metal-based NRR catalysts have achieved tremendous efforts in the past few years. However, further enhancement of their activity still needs to be improved by the following points: (1) The intrinsic nitrogen adsorption capacity on the metal surface is poor, which hinders the subsequent hydrogenation process and affects the NH_3 yield. (2) Although the *d*-orbital electrons of metals can be controlled through different physical and chemical methods, the metal-nitrogen bonding is weak. The *d*-orbital electrons tend to form metal-hydrogen bonds, thus leading to strong competitive side reactions and affecting FE. (3) The intrinsic lowporosity structural characteristics of metal materials are also not conducive to nitrogen fixation. Metal-free materials formed by strong covalent bonds have many unique physicochemical characteristics, including high surface area, controllable porosity, and excellent conductivity.¹³⁷⁻¹⁴⁰ Metal-free materials with the above advantages provide abundant anchor sites for nitrogen and intermediates. Moreover, the energy band gap, spin density, and charge density of the materials can be adjusted through doping and structural engineering, which further regulate the nitrogen adsorption and activation steps in the NRR process.^{141–143} Hence, metal-free materials with the optimized structure are ideal for designing high-performance and low-cost NRR electrocatalysts.

Graphitic carbon has been extensively investigated to suppress HER. However, the limited nitrogen adsorption ability is still a significant hurdle to further applications. The positive charge density of carbon can be affected by the adjacent heteroatoms with strong electronic affinity, which is conducive to nitrogen adsorption.^{21,144–147} The intrinsic activity of metal-free catalysts originated from the heteroatoms (such as boron, nitrogen, and oxygen).^{148–150} Take boron as an example, the electronegativity of boron (2.04) is much smaller than that of carbon (2.55). Herein, the positive charge on the boron atom can be induced by the significantly polarized B–C σ bonds (Figure 7A).¹⁴¹ The reverse opposite electronegativity creates Lewis acid sites with empty orbital for adsorption of the weak Lewis base N_2 and subsequent $N_x H_v$ intermediates (Figure 7B). Chang et al.¹⁵¹ fully utilized boron Lewis acid and boron/nitrogen Lewis acid/base pairs to design a series of boron/nitride-rich carbon (BCN) materials (Figure 7C). Comparing boron-enriched BCN (B-BCN) with nitrogen-enriched BCN (N-BCN), the density functional theory of the reaction pathway revealed that the energies of all steps of B-BCN are relatively lower than those of N-BCN, which further proves the NRR reaction facilitated by the boron Lewis acid site (Figure 7D). Based on the above theory, the author subsequently successfully prepared BCN materials with different boron and nitrogen contents, and the main structure of the materials was similar without any changes. This also makes it easier to discuss the active sources of materials at the atomic level. The prepared

BCN materials are nanomesh morphology with clear lattice fringes of the BCN(002) facet (Figure 7E). The assynthesized B-BCN exhibits enhanced NRR activity with the NH₃ yield of 8.39 μ g h⁻¹ cm⁻², three times that of N-BCN (Figure 7F). The concept of element doping or constructing multicomponent metal-free materials provides far-reaching guidance for the development of metal-free NRR materials in the future.

The particular morphology of structure and distinct electronic and chemical surface properties usually confer improved NRR activity and selectivity compared to bulk materials.^{154,155} In this sense, the reactivity of metal-free nanomaterials can be rationally tuned by constructing hierarchical porosity and defect engineering. Generally speaking, modifying the fundamental parameters (size, shape, surface composition, or loading on the support) further affects the enrichment of reaction intermediates on active sites and the electrolyte diffusion dynamics. Ma et al.¹⁵² synthesized a series of carbon-doped boron nitride (C-BN) with different microstructures at different calcination temperatures. The decomposition of raw urea released gases, inducing numerous large bubbles to form a porous structure. The as-synthesized C-BN possesses a large average-size of aperture (Figure 7G). Strong interaction between C atoms and B or N atoms leads to short bond distances of C–N/C–B. That induced the s/p electrons of the carbon atom, contributing to the valence band maximum. As a result, the optimized C-BN materials show an excellent NH₃ yield of $44.59 \,\mu g \, h^{-1} \, cm^{-2}$ and FE of 13.27% (Figure 7H). Zhang et al.¹⁵³ further regulated the structure of catalysts both at the micro level and at the nano level. The nitrogen-rich carbon with a high concentration of terminal nitrile groups and pyrazine nitrogen has been employed as an NRR catalyst. The as-obtained material shows a plate-like microscale structure with abundant small and aggregated nanoparticles inside (Figure 7I). Finally, an enhancement of NH₃ yield has been achieved at $5.68 \,\mu g h^{-1} m g^{-1}$ with an FE of 11.4% (Figure 7J).

To date, various works attempt to control the chemical nano/microstructures of carbon-based materials to design metal-free catalysts for potential electrochemical NRR. Considering complex catalyst active sites and complicated purposeful optimization of carbon-based materials, metal-free materials carrying high-concentration active centers with strong intrinsic activity are also developed. Based on the "like dissolves like" principle, Zhang et al.¹⁵⁶ designed and prepared few-layer black phosphorus nanosheets (BP) for electrochemical NRR. The zigzag and diff-zigzag edges of BP materials are the real N₂ adsorption/activation sites. A high acidic NH₃ yield of 31.37 μ g h⁻¹ mg⁻¹ with FE of 5.07% is achieved. These works provide the feasibility of using noncarbon metal-free materials as nitrogen-fixing



FIGURE 7 (A) Simplified schematics of N_2 bonding. (B) Schematic depiction of NRR mechanisms at the edge B atom sites. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2021, Elsevier.¹⁴¹ (C) Scheme of boron-enhanced NRR performance of boron carbonitride (BCN). (D) Free energy profile for the NRR process on B-BCN and N-BCN. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2022, Elsevier.¹⁵¹ (E) Transmission electron microscopy image and (F) NRR activity of B-BCN. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2021 Elsevier.¹⁴¹ (G) Scanning electron microscopy (SEM) image and (H) NRR activity of carbon-doped boron nitride. (I) SEM image and (J) NRR activity of metal-free C₂N. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2022, Wiley-VCH.¹⁵³

catalysts (such as black phosphorus and boron nitride), which can give access to the accurate investigation of the NRR mechanism.

2.3 | Electrolyte and cell optimization

Electrolytes participate in NRR by interacting with catalysts, reactants, intermediates, and products. Common aqueous electrolytes mainly contain inorganic salts, alkali metal cations, sulfate, and halogen ions. A deep mechanistic understanding of the electrolyte effect helps to improve NRR activity and selectivity through efficient electrolyte design. Up to date, most NRRs are performed in the aqueous phase, such as acidic solutions (sulfuric acid, hydrochloric acid, and perchloric acid), neutral solutions (sodium sulfate and phosphate buffer solution), and alkaline solutions (potassium hydroxide). Although abundant works reported the effects of electrolyte ions and pH on NRR activity and selectivity, the specific mechanism of the electrolyte effects still needs to be clarified and unified.^{157–160} It is theoretically foreseeable that the catalyst exhibits high NRR performance in acidic solutions. The abundant protons not only enhance HER but also provide sufficient proton sources for NRR. However, in actual experiments, the NRR performance can be affected by differences in cell structure, inherent characteristics of catalysts, impurity effects in electrolytes, and local pH gradients induced by reactions. Therefore, the optimization of electrolyte selection is crucial in the future development of NRR.

The optimization of electrolytes provides an opportunity to improve the selectivity of electrocatalytic NRR. In addition to traditional liquid electrolytes, lithium-mediated (such as LiClO₄ in ethanol or tetrahydrofuran [THF]) and water/ alcohol mixture (water/2-propanol) electrolytes promote N₂ solubility and are also gradually being developed.^{80,161} The specific analysis of lithium-mediated NRR (Li-NRR) will be described in detail in subsequent chapters. Considering the limited solubility of nitrogen in aqueous solutions, ionic liquids can serve as an excellent homogeneous electrolyte, effectively improving nitrogen solubility and highly inhibiting the progress of HER.^{162,163} Zhou et al.¹⁶² introduced hydrophobic and high nitrogen-solubility ionic liquids electrolyte ([C4mpyr][eFAP] and [P66.6.14][eFAP]) to achieve a high NRR FE of 60%. Meanwhile, Licht et al.¹⁶⁴ conducted NH₃ synthesis by air and vapor in a molten hydroxide (0.5 NaOH/0.5 KOH) electrolyte. NH3 is produced with high Coulombic efficiency (35%) at 1.2 V and 200°C. Although FE is highly desired, the complexity of high-temperature molten salt systems requires improvement and optimization to adapt to further applications.

Unlike liquid electrolytes, electrolytic NRR cells with solid electrolytes have the potential to overcome the typical low conversion rate during the NRR process.^{165–167} Due to the high conductivity of polymers in the low-temperature range, Nafion polymer electrolytes (solid H⁺ conductors) have good application prospects in low-temperature NH₃ synthesis. Sheets et al.¹⁵⁹ introduced Nafion polymer as the electrolyte for NH₃ synthesis from wet H₂ and dry N₂. Nafion achieves high current efficiency as an electrolyte on the membrane. However, the water retention rate decreases

CARBON ENERGY-WILEY

with the increase in temperature, thus blocking proton conductivity on the Nafion membrane and leading to decreased NRR activity. Lan et al.¹⁶⁸ tried to utilize H⁺/Li⁺/ NH₄⁺ mixed conducting Nafion membrane to resolve the issue. The treated conductive membrane increases the chemical compatibility between the acidic Nafion membrane and NH₃. The reaction system achieved the highest NH₃ yield and FE by increasing the temperature to 80°C. However, due to the blocking effect of Li⁺ on transferred protons, Li⁺ ions reduce the NH₃ formation, resulting in a relatively low current at higher applied voltages. Weakly alkaline NH₃ can react with acidic membranes, which has a negative impact on yield. Therefore, it is possible to introduce alkaline electrolytes into the reaction system to enhance ion conductivity.

The solid oxide NRR systems have different working principles, which involve a proton conductor with the deposition of anode/cathode on both sides. H₂ flows on the anode to convert to H⁺. As-produced protons are transported to the cathode and react with N₂ for NH₃ synthesis. Herein, high-temperature H⁺ conductors, such as SrCeO₃ and CsH₂PO₄, show different H⁺ conductivity, which can be an alternative to traditional solid-state electrolytes.^{169,170} To summarize, the stability of liquid organic electrolytes needs to be further improved. And the poor conductivity and high energy consumption of solid-state electrolyte systems directly lead to a low NH₃ conversion. In the future, liquid or solid electrolytes need to be selected, designed, and optimized according to the specific structure of the electrolytic cell.

Traditional H-type electrocatalytic cell still needs further improvement (Figure 8). The most common approach is to regulate basic operating parameters to optimize performance, such as reaction temperature, gas flow rate, and stirring rate. However, this optimization effect is extremely limited. Future works can focus on exploring the optimization of membranes and electrolytes. To improve the membrane of the H-type cell, it is possible to regulate the ion conductivity, NH₃ adsorption/leaching, interface blocking effect, and so forth. The



FIGURE 8 The design scheme of electrochemical cells for NRR.

-WILEY-**Carbon Energy**-

site blockade of various electrolyte cations can regulate proton-coupled electron transfer and NH_3 selectivity. Optimizing electrolytes with high N_2 solubility and diffusion coefficients, such as ionic liquids or organic electrolytes, can promote dissolution while weakening the occurrence of side reactions.

Although the H-type cells have made some achievements so far, this technology still needs to reach the appropriate industrial level regarding NH₃ production, FE, current density, and stability.^{171–173} The flow cells have shown high efficiency in fuel cells (oxygen reduction) and carbon dioxide reduction.¹⁷⁴⁻¹⁷⁶ In theory, flow cells can generate high current density and FE by improving the N₂ concentration at the electrode interface, alleviating mass transfer limitations, and further increasing the N_2 retention time (Figure 8). However, contrary to expectations, the performance of flow cells for NRR has yet to show a breakthrough effect so far. Therefore, the thermodynamics, kinetics, and fluid dynamics mechanisms of NRR in flow cells need to be thoroughly investigated. Meanwhile, the structure of flow cells also needs further systematic optimization, such as gas diffusion layer, electrolyte, electrolyte buffer layer, ion exchange membrane, and flow field.

3 | NITROGEN ACTIVATION VIA MEDIATORS

Currently, it is still a huge challenge to break the extremely strong N=N bond and directly reduce N₂ into NH₃ by providing electrons and protons at a sufficiently high chemical potential without generating H₂. As mentioned earlier, the optimization of electrolytes is one of the approaches to improve nitrogen activation efficiency. A possible way to avoid HER is to separate N₂ activation and subsequent protonation into NH₃. As one of the most widely studied mediators, lithium serves as a bridge for the above two steps.^{177,178} Moreover, transition metal or metal-free complexes and enzymes are also utilized as mediators for N₂ conversion under mild conditions.^{179,180}

3.1 | Lithium-mediated nitrogen reduction

Li-NRR is a potential candidate as a future NH_3 synthesis technology. Strictly speaking, Li-NRR belongs to the technologies for electrochemical NH_3 synthesis rather than electrocatalysis. Although Li-NRR is one of the most feasible pathways, the reaction mechanism of Li-NRR in nonaqueous systems is still unclear. Li-NRR generally refers to the reduction of Li⁺ into metal Li on the working electrode, which reacts with N_2 to generate lithium nitride (Li₃N) (Figure 9A).^{178,183} Li₃N is protonation with proton sources (such as alcohols) to achieve NH₃ synthesis. There are four explanations for the specific reaction mechanism as follows:

- Thermochemical nitrogen fixation and protonation will consume the electrodeposited lithium, thus producing NH₃ and lithium ethoxide.
- Metal lithium, Li₃N, and lithium hydride are utilized as electrocatalysts, and nitrogen is adsorbed, protonated, and reduced on the surface to form NH₃.
- 3) The relative transfer rates of lithium ions, nitrogen, and protons in a solid electrolyte interface (SEI) determine selectivity, meaning that an unbalanced diffusion rate will lead to excessive metal lithium or Li_3N or severe HERs.
- 4) The properties and concentration of proton donors determine the transfer properties of SEI.

The coupled kinetic transport model has been designed to investigate the rate influence mechanisms of Li-NRR.¹⁸¹ The FE of NH₃ synthesis is directly proportional to the N₂ pressure, indicating that the reaction is mainly related to the concentration of N₂ in the electrolyte. Therefore, increasing the partial pressure of N₂ can improve the performance of Li-NRR. Moreover, the optimal EtOH (proton carrier) concentration is ultimately determined to be 0.1 M by exploring the relationship between EtOH concentration and NH₃ yield.¹⁸⁴ The FE of NH₃ decreases under further increased EtOH concentration. At higher EtOH concentrations, the reaction between metal Li and EtOH becomes more intense, leading to a decrease in Li-NRR selectivity.

Furthermore, the role of SEI of lithium metal and its surface passivation layer in the Li-NRR process is still controversial. First, is the process driven by thermochemistry or electrocatalysis? That is, will lithium metal be consumed during the process? Second, since the Fermi energy level of lithium metal is higher than the lowest unoccupied molecular orbital (LUMO) of the existing electrolyte, it is highly susceptible to reduction. It is also necessary to confirm whether SEI is involved in the reaction. To further investigate the Li-NRR mechanism, Steinberg et al.¹⁸⁵ analyzed the entire Li-NRR process using cryoelectron microscopy. The results of cryoelectron microscopy indicate that the proton donor ethanol destroys the SEI structure by attacking the amorphous organic components in the SEI (Figure 9B).¹⁸¹ The destruction of amorphous SEI by ethanol may take various forms. The hydrogen generated by the reaction between ethanol and lithium metal can



FIGURE 9 (A) Scheme of Li-NRR process. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2019, Elsevier.¹⁷⁸ (B) Proposed SEI-based mechanism of Li-NRR in the presence of a proton donor. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2022, American Chemical Society.¹⁸¹ (C) Imaging the reaction interface of lithium-mediated nitrogen fixation via cryoelectron microscopy. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2023, Elsevier.¹⁸² (D) Scheme of the enzymatic fuel cell. (E) Bioelectrocatalytic NRR using the MoFe protein. (F) Single bioelectrochemical reactor for N₂ and CO₂ reduction into solid biomass. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2020, American Chemical Society.¹⁴

disrupt the mechanical stability of SEI. Meanwhile, the reaction between ethanol and lithium metal may produce advantageous SEI components with poor passivation and strong nitrogen permeability. The cryoelectron microscopy results indicate that the proton donor ethanol is the main driving force of Li-NRR (Figure 9C).¹⁸² Without the introduction of proton donors, the decomposition products of fluoroborate ions and THF form passive SEI, while nitrogen and electrolyte cannot penetrate and pass through SEI. Meanwhile, lithium ions can diffuse in this SEI, leading to the continuous formation of lithium dendrites, which is not conducive to the subsequent reaction.¹⁸⁴ With the introduction of ethanol, amorphous SEI will mainly consist of ethanol decomposition products. Nitrogen and electrolyte can penetrate this interface, continuously consuming the deposited lithium metal to form NH₃. For the Li-NRR system, it is necessary to introduce some proton donors to construct SEI with poor passivation to synthesize NH₃ effectively. However, if there is an excessive reaction between metal

13 of 27

lithium and proton donors, hydrogen gas will be generated, leading to the irreversible loss of metal lithium.

It is still challenging to improve the Li-NRR activity and stability in the future. Currently, the strategies developed to improve the Li-NRR performance mainly include the potential cycling strategy, adding auxiliary oxygen, increasing electrode surface area, introducing gas diffusion electrodes, and optimizing electrolyte or ionic liquids as proton shuttle agents.¹⁸⁶⁻¹⁸⁹ Li et al.¹⁹⁰ conducted in-depth research on the reaction mechanism and reported that adding a small amount of oxygen to the reaction atmosphere significantly improves the FE and stability of the Li-NRR process. This counterintuitive result focuses on the effectiveness of controlling the competition of H⁺, N₂, and Li⁺ ions on the catalyst surface. This model indicates that oxygen can slow down the diffusion of Li⁺ through the SEI layer while maintaining the optimal relationship between surface available H^+ and N_2 . Meanwhile, Fu et al.¹⁹¹ designed a Li-NRR and hydrogen oxidation coupled continuous flow electrolytic cell equipped with a $5 \text{ cm} \times 5 \text{ cm}$ gas diffusion electrode. A three-chamber continuous flow cell was constructed. The gas diffusion electrode based on stainless steel cloth is located between the gas flow field and the electrolyte chamber, and the gas reactants can be directly fed to one side of the stainless steel cloth electrode, while the electrolyte is fed on the other side. This reaction system exhibits excellent catalytic activity and stability. Based on current exploration, in the subsequent design and improvement of Li-NRR, it is necessary to choose appropriate lithium salts and solvent combinations and introduce high-stability proton donors to achieve SEI activation while avoiding the loss of metallic lithium and improving reaction safety and production efficiency.

3.2 | Complex-compound-mediated nitrogen reduction

To better understand the reaction mechanism and develop catalysts for NH_3 synthesis under mild conditions, tremendous efforts have been made in N_2 activation with transition metal complexes, and several catalytic systems for nitrogen fixation have also been developed.¹⁹² The detailed NRR mechanisms on the transition metal complex system closely related to nitrogenase are still unclear. Insightful mechanistic works are urgently needed to investigate the critical bond-breaking/making steps. Only one molecular electrocatalyst (tri (phosphine) borane iron system) has been reported to reliably proved the reaction mechanism, but

it needs a lower temperature (-35°C) to slow down the background HER and high reduction potential.¹⁹³ Huang et al.¹⁹⁴ first separated and characterized the neutral hydrazide complex intermediate ([V]=NNH₂) in the vanadium metal complexes catalyzed NRR system. Dinitrogen compounds and NH₃ were obtained by the reduction of protonation by vanadium amino complexes ([V]–NH₂). The distal pathway was possibly involved in the N₂ conversion into NH₃ in this system. Vanadium complexes with aryloxy auxiliary ligands serve as a unique system to stabilize active nitrogen-containing species (N_xH_y) and promote the catalytic conversion of N₂ into NH₃.

Meanwhile, Garrido-Barros et al.¹⁹⁵ introduced a tandem approach to optimize the selectivity of electrocatalytic NRR. The HER is prevented by using a protoncoupled electron transfer mediator, tethered Brønsted base modified cobaltocenium (abbreviated as **Co**). The tandem system consists of bis(diphenylphosphinoethane) tungsten system (abbreviated as W) and THF solvent, 0.2 M [tetra-N-butylammonium][BF₄] electrolyte, and TsOH acid. In the presence of **Co**, this system achieves a high FE of 18% and excellent stability for 11 h reaction at -1.35 V. This catalyst successfully achieved the binding of M-N₂ and the enhanced NH₃ synthesis via different M-N_xH_y intermediates. Meanwhile, the protoncoupled electron transfer step connects the electrode and TsOH acid to facilitate the formation of N-H bonds at an optimized potential of -1.2 V versus ferrocenium/ ferrocene and construct the closed loop of the N₂ reduction cycle. Furthermore, the investigation of different metal complexes (W, Mo, Os, and Fe) as mediators also confirmed the universality of the tandem approach.

3.3 | Enzyme-mediated nitrogen reduction

Nitrogenase is a metal enzyme closely related to the fields of agriculture, environment, and energy. Nitrogenase is widely known for its role in catalyzing the conversion of atmospheric N₂ into bioavailable NH₃. The catalysis of traditional molybdenum nitrogenase utilizes the reductase component to transfer electrons to the catalytic component for substrate reduction.^{196–198} The reductase component (ferritin) contains ATP-binding sites and subunit bridging (Fe₄S₄) clusters within each subunit. Molybdenum iron protein, known as a catalytic component, is a type of $\alpha_2\beta_2$ -isotetramer, which contains a P-cluster ([Fe₈S₇]) at each α/β -subunit interface and an M-cluster (R-homocitate MoFe₇S₉C) at each α -subunit. During the substrate conversion process, the two components of molybdenum nitrogenase form functional

complexes, allowing ATP-dependent electrons to transfer from the (Fe₄S₄) cluster of Fe protein through the P cluster to the M cluster.¹⁹⁹ Once MoFe proteins accumulate enough electrons, substrate reduction occurs. There has been widespread interest in the direct transfer of electrons to MoFe proteins.²⁰⁰ The alternative in vitro reducing agents effectively reduce MoFe proteins and support substrate reduction. However, this approach is usually limited by reducing substrates other than N₂ at meager rates. Up to now, various enzymes (such as bilirubin oxidase, carbon monoxide dehydrogenase, hydrogenase, and glucose oxidase) have been successfully immobilized on the electrode surface (Figure 9D).¹⁴ On the electrode surface, the heterogeneous electron transfer of enzymes supports the reduction or oxidation of enzyme substrates, respectively. Electron transfer occurs directly or through the utilization of electronic mediators. In situ observation of electron transfer to/ from enzymes can evaluate enzyme-mediated mechanisms and kinetics. Furthermore, the ability to produce important chemicals via bioelectrochemical processes can avoid the need for harsh reaction conditions or expensive catalysts.

Milton et al.²⁰¹ reported the immobilization of nitrogenase 6-98^{Tyr-His} MoFe protein on an electrode surface. An electron mediator, cobaltocene, was introduced to promote in situ electrochemical observation of azide/nitrite reduction to NH_3 (Figure 9E). Structural analog cobaltocene (bis(cyclopentadienyl)cobalt(III)) efficiently reduces MoFe protein at the electrode surface. In situ observation of enzyme-mediated reduction catalytic reactions provides an alternative method for exploring the kinetics, substrate interactions, inhibitory effects, and electron transfer pathways of MoFe proteins.²⁰² The observed bioelectrocatalysis has been obtained without Fe protein in MoFe protein, which negates the mechanistic rate-limiting steps related to the Fe protein cycle. Herein, this method will be conducive to investigating the mechanism details of nitrogenase and provide a technical basis for the establishment of bioelectrocatalytic technology for NH₃ synthesis at mild conditions. By regulating the concentration of local electron mediators, MoFe protein immobilized on suitable redox polymer species will increase electron flux and achieve efficient NRR.²⁰¹ In addition to the protein immobilization strategy, exploring the role of ATP in vivo will promote NRR on the surface of bioelectrodes. Based on the previous work, Liu et al.²⁰³ proposed an upgraded N₂ and CO₂ reduction reactor to solid biomass, which couples electrocatalytic water splitting with H₂ oxidizing bacteria, Xanthobacter autotrophicus (Figure 9F). The HER is carried out using a biocompatible catalyst of cobalt phosphorus alloy, and oxygen evolution is CARBON ENERGY-WILEY-

achieved using oxidized cobalt phosphate. Under microaerobic conditions, *X. autotrophicus* utilizes hydrogen gas to immobilize N_2 and convert it into biomass. Moreover, when biomass formation is inhibited, NH_3 can diffuse into an extracellular culture medium, thereby achieving NH_3 synthesis.

To summarize, considering that HER occupies the dominant position on most electrode surfaces, decoupling nitrogen activation from the protonation process is a potential strategy to solve the poor selectivity of the current NH₃ synthesis system. This strategy has been successfully implemented through lithium-mediated, complex-mediated, and enzyme-mediated approaches. Although the introduction of mediators has significantly improved the FE, the NH₃ synthesis using mediators still needs to be improved to address issues of high reduction potential and high energy costs. Moreover, the risk of lithium production and the poor stability of complex/ enzymes further limit the large-scale application of mediated NH₃ synthesis. Even though the mediated NH₃ synthesis technology is still in the early stages, it has shown certain development potential. It is possible to ultimately achieve efficient and stable mediated NH₃ synthesis via the targeted technology optimization and mechanism exploration.

- In the Li-NRR system, the electrodeposition of Li⁺ requires a high potential. Is it possible for lithium alloys (Li-Na/K/Cs/Mg/Ca) to achieve effective activation of nitrogen while reducing the deposition potential of Li⁺?
- 2) The electrolyte used in the Li-NRR system is volatile THF, which directly affects the stability of the system. Phosphonate cation species have high chemical, thermal, and electrochemical stability, which is a potential alternative to promote Li-NRR stability. Moreover, many liquid electrolytes used in the field of lithium batteries and lithium-sulfur batteries (carbonate, cyclic carbonate, g-pantolactone, and sulfolane) may also be alternative solvents in Li-NRR systems.
- 3) The poor stability of the Li-NRR system is induced by the weak stability of the protonation reagent in the reaction of $\text{Li}_3\text{N} + 3\text{H}^+ \rightarrow 3\text{Li}^+ + \text{NH}_3$. Similar challenges exist in enzyme/complex-mediated systems. Therefore, the key point is a more stable protonation reagent, which can prevent overoxidation/reduction at the anode/cathode.
- 4) Based on the hydrophobic and anhydrous environment of nitrogenase catalytic active sites, cell additives are used to further adjust the SEI and enhance the Li-NRR activity of electrodes. A stable and mainly inorganic SEI can improve kinetic stability even in

aqueous cells. Introducing aqueous electrolytes into the Li-NRR reaction system is a challenging but potentially feasible strategy.

4 | HIGH-ENERGY ACTIVATION OF NITROGEN

As mentioned above, electrocatalytic NH₃ synthesis has significant advantages, such as mild reaction conditions, compatibility with renewable energy systems, controllable scale suitable for offsite production, and no use of hydrogen raw materials. However, the high nonreactivity of N₂ and low solubility in water make it difficult to implement electrochemical NRR directly. The current NRR system is still significantly hindered by low NH₃ generation rate and FE. Although the introduction of lithium-mediated systems significantly improves the reaction rate and current density, the significant overpotential of Li-NRR at a minimum of 3 V endows this process with inherent energy intention. The severe requirements for ultradry and oxygen-free organic solvents, high pressure and low stability, and increased requirements for pure hydrogen and metallic lithium raw materials are significant drawbacks of this approach. Unlike nitrogen, nitrate is highly soluble in solution, making it easier for NO_x to overcome the difficulty of nitrogen intermediates conversion and thus easier to reduce and synthesize NH₃.²⁰⁴⁻²⁰⁷ Therefore, coupling electrochemistry with high-energy physics to activate nitrogen can achieve high-efficiency NH₃ synthesis while avoiding the problem of traditional homogeneous NRR systems.

4.1 | Plasma activation

Inspired by the lightning-driven nitrogen activation process in nature and the industrial process of thermal plasma nitrogen fixation, the nonthermal plasma induced by spark, glow, and dielectric barrier discharge has recently attracted wide attention and has been applied to the N₂ activation.^{208,209} Currently, nonthermal plasma composed of a series of substances with different energy levels has been utilized for various applications of rapid synthesis and surface modification of materials.²¹⁰⁻²¹² High-energy electrons with much higher temperature than the surrounding gas are generated in the nonthermal plasma. Therefore, nonthermal plasma can weaken or even split stable N₂ into more reactive NO_x species at low temperatures.²¹³ Meanwhile, the generation of NO_x by nonthermal plasma has a lower energy consumption with a theoretical energy limit of

 5.56×10^{-2} kW h/mol_{NO}, which is 2.5 times lower than that of the Haber-Bosch process (0.4 kW h/mol_{NH₂}). For subsequent electrochemical reactions, the standard potential of NO_x reduction into NH₃ is more positive than that of NRR, which means that electrochemical nitrate reduction reaction (NIRR) is thermodynamically easier to perform compared to the NRR process.^{214–216} Moreover, the standard reduction potential gap between NIRR and HER is much greater than that between NRR and HER, which indicates that NIRR can be theoretically carried out in a broader range of reduction potential than NRR without interfering with the side HER reaction. Therefore, coupling nonthermal plasma with electrochemical NH₃ synthesis can significantly increase NH₃ yield. Sun et al.²¹³ have designed a plasma integrated within an H-cell electrochemical system. This NH₃ synthesis system consists of two steps: (1) nonthermal plasma activation of nitrogen gas in the air to produce NO_x with reduced specific energy consumption and (2) electrochemical conversion of the resulting NO_x into NH₃ with enhanced yield. To further investigate the characteristics of scalable plasma bubble column reactors and how they improve energy efficiency, several different design configurations were developed. The breakdown voltage was reduced owing to the generation of plasma within bubbles at lower energy inputs. The authors subsequently explored the mechanisms and pathways of NO_x generation induced by two different plasma discharge states in the reactor. The glow discharge mainly contributes to N₂ and O₂ activation with the formation of excited N*, vibrational state N2, O*, and O3 species, as well as a small amount of NO_x. The strong N=N bond (9.8 eV) can be broken via vibrational excitation, and the activated nitrogen species react with the activated oxygen species to form NO_x . In the spark discharge state, higher energy levels contribute to NO_x formation, and the NO production rate is proportional to the vibration temperature of N₂. Meanwhile, the interaction between plasma and liquid is conducive to OH radical generation, which in turn promotes the transport of reactive NO_x into the solution. Subsequently, a significant increase in NH₃ yield was achieved at the milligram level.

Integrating plasma-induced N₂ activation and electrocatalytic NO_x^- reduction has already exhibited great promise for renewable NH_3 synthesis (Figure 10A).^{219,220} Ren et al.²¹⁷ achieved efficient NH_3 synthesis by an innovative spark discharge plasma cascade electrochemical NIRR integrated system. Based on optimizing the plasma process, the plasma activation effects on N₂/O₂ and the NO_x formation process were systematically explored (Figure 10B). The spark discharge parameters (spark discharge distance and O₂ volume content in the feed gas) directly affect the composition of gas products



FIGURE 10 (A) Scheme of the plasma-induced NH₃ synthesis system. Digital photo of spark discharge setup with the (B) discharge times and (C) distances. (D) Concentration of NO_x at different plasma-discharge distances. (E) NH₃ partial current density and (F) NH₃ yield rate and FE with the increase of spark discharge time. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2022, American Chemical Society.²¹⁷ (G) Schematic diagram of NO_x absorption/reduction system with TENG and corresponding working principle. (H) Schematic diagram and photograph of the self-powered radial-engine shaped TENG system. Reproduced with permission: Copyright 2022, American Chemical Society.²¹⁸

(Figure 10C). As the spark discharge distance increases, the total NO_x^{-} shows a trend of volcanic eruption. The residence time of reactants in the emission zone will increase with the extent of spark distance, ultimately increasing NO_x concentration (Figure 10D,E). The further increased spark distance will consume more energy for an electrical breakdown of reactants, thus inducing the decrease in NO_x concentration (Figure 10F). In the subsequent NIRR process, in situ electrochemical attenuated total reflection Fourier-transform infrared

spectroscopy verified the continuous protonation process of NO_x⁻ and nitrogen intermediates NH_x. In situ Raman spectroscopy revealed the in situ reconstruction of high valent copper to Cu⁰ species on Cu nanoparticles during the NIRR process. Based on the above reaction mechanism and technology optimization, the integrated system ultimately achieved a high NH₃ yield of 40 nmol s⁻¹ cm⁻² and FE of 90%, surpassing the traditional NRR process and Li-mediated NRR process. However, up to this date, the micro impact mechanisms of plasma on the N₂/O₂

17 of 27

activation process and the NO_x formation process are still unclear. The further development of this integration system for NH_3 electrosynthesis requires an in-depth exploration of plasma process enhancement and in situ characterizations.

4.2 | Triboelectric activation

Triboelectric nanogenerator (TENG), which originated from Maxwell's displacement current, is a novel technology for energy collection with great practical value. A series of TENGs was utilized to convert various forms of mechanical energy into electrical energy for further energy conversion applications.^{221,222} The strong electric field established by TENG can easily realize chemical N≡N bond cleavage. Han et al.²²³ constructed a novel TENG, which can directly utilize air as the nitrogen source for electrocatalytic NH_3 synthesis (Figure 10G). TENG-generated high pressure induced air discharge for further N_2/O_2 ionization and NO_x formation. Water flushing with NO_x gas flows directly forms electrolytes containing NO_3^- and NO_2^- for further NIRR. Driven by another working TENG, an electrochemical cell using TiO₂ as a catalyst undergoes electrocatalytic NIRR to synthesize NH₃. Considering the strong ultraviolet absorption interference, the authors introduced a dualchamber cell with a fuel cell structure. Two peristaltic pumps were applied to recycle pure water and nitrate solution to the anode and cathode regions. After the reaction, the NH₃ production yield in the cathode reached 27.5 μ g h⁻¹.

Han et al.²¹⁸ further constructed a self-powered system with TENG by coupling a dual-chamber electrochemical cell and the aforementioned discharge device (Figure 10H). The blower, as an exhaust gas source, combined with dual TENG and commercial turbochargers to drive the system to synthesize NH₃. After voltage reduction and rectification, TENG outputs approximately 3.1 V and 8.9 mA voltage and current for the dual chamber electrocatalytic cell, respectively. After 10 h of reaction, the self-powered system successfully synthesized NH₃. By measuring the volume of the solution involved in the cathodic reaction, it was found that the NH₃ yield of this self-powered system reached $2.4 \,\mu g h^{-1}$ without any energy input. The above works prove that it is feasible to reuse the residual kinetic energy of factory exhaust gas to drive the NH₃ synthesis system with the coupling of turbochargers. Compared with traditional NH₃ synthesis strategies, this system demonstrates enormous potential in NH₃ synthesis with the advantages of self-power supply, low cost, easy manufacture, environmental protection, scalability, and easy installation.

5 | SUMMARY AND OUTLOOK

Environmental electrochemical NRR for green NH₃ synthesis is considered a potential alternative to the Haber-Bosch process. Tremendous efforts have been proceeded to explore electrocatalysts, electrolytes, and cell configurations for the promotion of NH₃ synthesis selectivity, efficiency, and stability. However, the NRR performance is still limited by issues such as low nitrogen solubility, difficult nitrogen activation, strong hydrogen evolution side reactions, and susceptibility to NH₃ pollution in the system. The complexity of the six electron/proton reduction involved in the reaction is extreme, with challenges in mechanism analysis. Thus, to improve the nitrogen activation ability and the feasibility of NRR experiments, this review summarizes a series of strategies, including the design of different materials, the optimization of electrolyte and electrochemical cell systems, and advanced interdisciplinary applications. Based on the in-depth analysis of the representative works, we propose some novel insights and feasible research directions for achieving effective nitrogen activation and completing subsequent hydrogenation reactions with high selectivity and stability.

5.1 | For effective NRR electrocatalysts

Regulation of surface reactions is crucial for enhancing affinity toward N-materials and improving NRR reaction kinetics. Most currently developed NRR electrocatalysts are still in their bulk or microstructure forms. The introduction of strategies to control surface reactions is highly desirable, such as defect engineering, heteroatom doping, interface/surface engineering, and ion regulation (Figure 11). The development of nanostructured electrocatalysts or self-supported independent electrodes is conducive to the accessibility of beneficial active sites and mass transfer. Designing nanostructured electrocatalysts, such as ultrathin two-dimensional nanosheets and single-atom catalysts, is highly desirable for significantly improving the density of the NH₃ synthesis active site. Meanwhile, the crystal structure and exposed facets significantly affect the adsorption behavior of reactants in NRR. The optimal samples can be determined by preparing and screening electrocatalysts with different surface structures. Based on the volcano mapping, selecting appropriate bimetallic, multimetallic, or highentropy alloys to change the binding configuration of reaction intermediates is recommended. Modifying the d-block transition metals with p-block elements can break the linear scaling relationship between the energy of *N₂H and *NH₂. For instance, the introduction of

Grain boundary Sizetuning Electrochemical Defect tuning Crystal face/ nitrogen reduction NH₃ N₂ uo!}!sodulo? οσειτοτα

FIGURE 11 Scheme of various strategies for designing aqueous NRR electrocatalysts.



FIGURE 12 Scheme of advanced interdisciplinary strategies for NRR system optimization.

Lewis acidic B element into the system can facilitate the π -backdonation effect, achieving efficient N₂ activation and adsorption and optimizing subsequent hydrogenation reactions. Moreover, semiconductor electrocatalysts (TiO₂, Fe₂O₃, MoS₂, etc.) have also shown specific potential for limiting the availability of electrons, thereby suppressing HER and consequently enhancing NRR selectivity and stability.

5.2 For optimized reaction systems

Nonaqueous Li-NRR and complex/enzyme-mediated NRR face many challenges, such as high cell voltage, high ohmic resistance, evaporation of organic solvents, proton transport limitations, the safety of lithium metals, and stability of mediated catalytic systems (Figure 12). To achieve high FE and high stability in flow cells at industrial current densities, there are still many optimization points for mediated catalytic systems in the future. The local microenvironment and mass transfer conditions need to be optimized by regulating the Helmholtz buffer layer on the electrode surface with a tuned electrode-electrolyte-gas threephase interface. The key to further improving the stability of the reaction system is to introduce electrolytes with high chemical, thermal, and electrochemical stability and stable protonation reagents (to prevent excessive oxidation/reduction of anode/cathode). In

addition, researchers have made progress in understanding the strategies for controlling NRR selectivity in plasma and TENG-mediated processes, but the specific reaction mechanisms still need further exploration. High-energy physics activation of nitrogen (plasma, TENG, magnetron sputtering, or even laser) coupled with electrocatalytic NH₃ synthesis is an important research direction for future development.

5.3 For mechanism investigation

NRR possesses complex reaction pathways, and the catalyst structure may change during the reaction process. The application of in situ/operando characterization techniques in NRR is highly desirable to establish a precise structureperformance relationship by exploring the interactions between nitrogen, N_xH_y intermediates, catalytic active sites, and solvent and cation effects. Despite the impressive progress made in in-situ/operando characterizations, there still remain several challenges in this field. Due to the limited catalytic information provided by any single in situ/operando technique, it is necessary to perform multiple tests on the same reactor to simultaneously detect changes in the catalyst structure and the intermediate evolution. Furthermore, the signal intensities of N_xH_y intermediates require improvement owing to the low coverage. Another major challenge of in situ/operando experiments is the optimal design of specific electrolytic cells coupling multiple in situ/operando

19 of 27

techniques and NRR systems with mediators at high temperatures or pressures. Obtaining effective information is more convincing for exploring aqueous NRR or Li-/ complex/enzyme-mediated NRR mechanisms. Theoretical research on adsorption-free energy, microscopic kinetic models, volcanic mapping, and *d*-band centers can be applied to predict the catalytic behavior of electrocatalysts and obtain a fundamental understanding of catalytic mechanisms. Currently, many theoretical studies have been carried out to reveal the novel NRR systems and the corresponding catalytic mechanisms (such as changes in the electronic structure of the catalyst, association or dissociation mechanism, reaction process, and corresponding intermediate/direct products). In the future, the close integration of theoretical calculations and in situ/operando experiments is a practical approach to exploring reaction thermodynamics/ kinetics and pathways.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was supported by the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC), the Fonds de Recherche du Québec-Nature et Technologies (FRQNT), Centre Québécois sur les Materiaux Fonctionnels (CQMF), Institut National de la Recherche Scientifique (INRS), École de Technologie Supérieure (ÉTS), and the King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST). Dr. Gaixia Zhang thanks for the support from the Marcelle-Gauvreau Engineering Research Chair program.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT

The authors declare that there are no conflicts of interests.

ORCID

Shuhui Sun 🗅 http://orcid.org/0000-0002-0508-2944

REFERENCES

- 1. Chen JG, Crooks RM, Seefeldt LC, et al. Beyond fossil fueldriven nitrogen transformations. *Science*. 2018;360(6391): eaar6611.
- Nishibayashi Y, Saito M, Uemura S, Takekuma S, Takekuma H, Yoshida Z. A non-metal system for nitrogen fixation. *Nature*. 2004;428(6980):279-280.
- 3. Shi R, Zhang X, Waterhouse GIN, Zhao Y, Zhang T. The journey toward low temperature, low pressure catalytic nitrogen fixation. *Adv Energy Mater*. 2020;10(19):2000659.
- 4. Wang Y, Meyer TJ. A route to renewable energy triggered by the Haber–Bosch process. *Chem.* 2019;5(3):496-497.
- Kyriakou V, Garagounis I, Vourros A, Vasileiou E, Stoukides M. An electrochemical Haber–Bosch process. *Joule*. 2020;4(1): 142-158.
- Sun Y, Wu W, Yu L, et al. Asymmetric acidic/alkaline N₂ electrofixation accelerated by high-entropy metal-organic framework derivatives. *Carbon Energy*. 2023;5(3):e263.

- Zhang X, Cao Y, Huang Z-F, et al. Regulating the interfacial charge transfer and constructing symmetry-breaking sites for the enhanced N₂ electroreduction activity. *Carbon Energy*. 2023;5(2):e266.
- Yu W, Yu J, Huang M, et al. Laser-controlled tandem catalytic sites of CuNi alloys with ampere-level electrocatalytic nitrate-to-ammonia reduction activities for Zn-nitrate batteries. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2023;16(7):2991-3001.
- Chang B, Pang H, Raziq F, et al. Electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide to multicarbon (C₂₊) products: challenges and perspectives. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2023;16(11):4714-4758.
- Huang W, Su C, Zhu C, et al. Isolated electron trap-induced charge accumulation for efficient photocatalytic hydrogen production. *Angew Chem.* 2023;135(25):e202304634.
- 11. Zhang X, Huang W, Yu L, et al. Enabling heterogeneous catalysis to achieve carbon neutrality: directional catalytic conversion of CO_2 into carboxylic acids. *Carbon Energy*. 2023. In press. doi:10.1002/cey2.362
- Guo W, Zhang K, Liang Z, Zou R, Xu Q. Electrochemical nitrogen fixation and utilization: theories, advanced catalyst materials and system design. *Chem Soc Rev.* 2019;48(24): 5658-5716.
- Pang Y, Su C, Jia G, Xu L, Shao Z. Emerging twodimensional nanomaterials for electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *Chem Soc Rev.* 2021;50(22):12744-12787.
- 14. Qing G, Ghazfar R, Jackowski ST, et al. Recent advances and challenges of electrocatalytic N_2 reduction to ammonia. *Chem Rev.* 2020;120(12):5437-5516.
- Zhao X, Hu G, Chen GF, Zhang H, Zhang S, Wang H. Comprehensive understanding of the thriving ambient electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction. *Adv Mater*. 2021;33(33):2007650.
- Lin L, Wei F, Jiang R, Huang Y, Lin S. The role of central heteroatom in electrochemical nitrogen reduction catalyzed by polyoxometalate-supported single-atom catalyst. *Nano Res.* 2022;16(1):309-317.
- Li S, Wang Y, Du Y, et al. P-block metal-based electrocatalysts for nitrogen reduction to ammonia: a minireview. *Small.* 2023;19(16):2206776.
- Liu C, Tian A, Li Q, et al. 2D, metal-free electrocatalysts for the nitrogen reduction reaction. *Adv Funct Mater*. 2022;33(9): 2210759.
- Tort R, Westhead O, Spry M, et al. Nonaqueous Li-mediated nitrogen reduction: taking control of potentials. ACS Energy Lett. 2023;8(2):1003-1009.
- Liu D, Chen M, Du X, et al. Development of electrocatalysts for efficient nitrogen reduction reaction under ambient condition. *Adv Funct Mater.* 2020;31(11):2008983.
- Yang X, Mukherjee S, O'Carroll T, et al. Achievements, challenges, and perspectives on nitrogen electrochemistry for carbon-neutral energy technologies. *Angew Chem Int Ed.* 2022;135(10):e202215938.
- Zheng J, Jiang L, Lyu Y, Jiang SP, Wang S. Green synthesis of nitrogen-to-ammonia fixation: past, present, and future. *Energy Environ Mater*. 2021;5(2):452-457.
- 23. Seh ZW, Kibsgaard J, Dickens CF, Chorkendorff I, Nørskov JK, Jaramillo TF. Combining theory and experiment in electrocatalysis: insights into materials design. *Science*. 2017;355(6321):aad4998.

- 24. Yang B, Ding W, Zhang H, Zhang S. Recent progress in electrochemical synthesis of ammonia from nitrogen: strategies to improve the catalytic activity and selectivity. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2021;14(2):672-687.
- Arif M, Babar M, Azhar U, et al. Rational design and modulation strategies of Mo-based electrocatalysts and photo/electrocatalysts towards nitrogen reduction to ammonia (NH₃). *Chem Eng J.* 2023;451:138320.
- Shen H, Choi C, Masa J, et al. Electrochemical ammonia synthesis: mechanistic understanding and catalyst design. *Chem.* 2021;7(7):1708-1754.
- Han Z, Wu P, He M, Zhuang X, Lin H, Han S. Ammonia synthesis by electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction—a novel energy storage way. *J Energy Storage*. 2022;55:105684.
- 28. Guo X, Du H, Qu F, Li J. Recent progress in electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction. *J Mater Chem A*. 2019;7(8):3531-3543.
- 29. Wen L, Sun K, Liu X, Yang W, Li L, Jiang HL. Electronic state and microenvironment modulation of metal nanoparticles stabilized by MOFs for boosting electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction. *Adv Mater.* 2023;35(15):2210669.
- Izelaar B, Ripepi D, Asperti S, et al. Revisiting the electrochemical nitrogen reduction on molybdenum and iron carbides: promising catalysts or false positives? ACS Catal. 2023;13(3):1649-1661.
- Yang X, Tian Y, Mukherjee S, et al. Constructing oxygen vacancies via engineering heterostructured Fe₃C/Fe₃O₄ catalysts for electrochemical ammonia synthesis. *Angew Chem Int Ed.* 2023;62(34):202304797.
- Qiang S, Wu F, Yu J, Liu YT, Ding B. Complementary design in multicomponent electrocatalysts for electrochemical nitrogen reduction: beyond the leverage in activity and selectivity. *Angew Chem Int Ed.* 2023;62(15):202217265.
- 33. Park SY, Jang YJ, Youn DH. A review of transition metal nitride-based catalysts for electrochemical nitrogen reduction to ammonia. *Catalysts.* 2023;13(3):639.
- Macleod KC, Holland PL. Recent developments in the homogeneous reduction of dinitrogen by molybdenum and iron. *Nat Chem.* 2013;5(7):559-565.
- Anderson JS, Rittle J, Peters JC. Catalytic conversion of nitrogen to ammonia by an iron model complex. *Nature*. 2013;501(7465):84-87.
- Su L, Yang D, Jiang Y, et al. A bioinspired iron-molybdenum μ-nitrido complex and its reactivity toward ammonia formation. *Angew Chem Int Ed.* 2022;61(30):e202203121.
- Hoffman BM, Lukoyanov D, Dean DR, Seefeldt LC. Nitrogenase: a draft mechanism. Acc Chem Res. 2013;46(2):587-595.
- Cai R, Minteer SD. Nitrogenase bioelectrocatalysis: from understanding electron-transfer mechanisms to energy applications. ACS Energy Lett. 2018;3(11):2736-2742.
- 39. Harris DF, Lukoyanov DA, Shaw S, et al. Mechanism of N_2 reduction catalyzed by Fe-nitrogenase involves reductive elimination of H_2 . *Biochemistry*. 2018;57(5):701-710.
- 40. McKee ML. A new nitrogenase mechanism using a CFe_8S_9 model: does H_2 elimination activate the complex to N_2 addition to the central carbon atom? *J Phys Chem A*. 2016;120(5):754-764.
- Badalyan A, Yang Z-Y, Seefeldt LC. A voltammetric study of nitrogenase catalysis using electron transfer mediators. ACS Catal. 2019;9(2):1366-1372.

CARBON ENERGY-WILEY

- 42. Milton RD, Minteer SD. Enzymatic bioelectrosynthetic ammonia production: recent electrochemistry of nitrogenase, nitrate reductase, and nitrite reductase. *ChemPlusChem*. 2017;82(4):513-521.
- Han X-Q, Lang Z-L, Zhang F-Y, Xu H-L, Su Z-M. Computational evaluation of femo heteroatom coeffect induced high electroreduction activity of N₂-to-NH₃. *Appl Surf Sci.* 2022;579:152214.
- Chen A, Xia BY. Ambient dinitrogen electrocatalytic reduction for ammonia synthesis. J Mater Chem A. 2019;7(41): 23416-23431.
- 45. Xue X, Chen R, Yan C, et al. Review on photocatalytic and electrocatalytic artificial nitrogen fixation for ammonia synthesis at mild conditions: advances, challenges and perspectives. *Nano Res.* 2019;12(6):1229-1249.
- Islam J, Shareef M, Zabed HM, et al. Electrochemical nitrogen fixation in metal-N₂ batteries: a paradigm for simultaneous NH₃ synthesis and energy generation. *Energy Stor Mater.* 2023;54:98-119.
- 47. Ren Y, Yu C, Tan X, Huang H, Wei Q, Qiu J. Strategies to suppress hydrogen evolution for highly selective electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction: challenges and perspectives. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2021;14(3):1176-1193.
- Choi C, Back S, Kim N-Y, Lim J, Kim Y-H, Jung Y. Suppression of hydrogen evolution reaction in electrochemical N₂ reduction using single-atom catalysts: a computational guideline. ACS Catal. 2018;8(8):7517-7525.
- Höskuldsson ÁB, Tayyebi E, Skúlason E. Computational examination of the kinetics of electrochemical nitrogen reduction and hydrogen evolution on a tungsten electrode. *J Catal.* 2021;404:362-370.
- Zhu H, Ren X, Yang X, Liang X, Liu A, Wu G. Fe-based catalysts for nitrogen reduction toward ammonia electrosynthesis under ambient conditions. *SusMat.* 2022;2(3): 214-242.
- Wan Y, Xu J, Lv R. Heterogeneous electrocatalysts design for nitrogen reduction reaction under ambient conditions. *Mater Today*. 2019;27:69-90.
- Patil SB, Wang DY. Exploration and investigation of periodic elements for electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction. *Small.* 2020;16(45):e2002885.
- Zhou H, Xiong B, Chen L, Shi J. Modulation strategies of Cubased electrocatalysts for efficient nitrogen reduction. *J Mater Chem A*. 2020;8(39):20286-20293.
- Du L, Xing L, Zhang G, Liu X, Rawach D, Sun S. Engineering of electrocatalyst/electrolyte interface for ambient ammonia synthesis. *SusMat.* 2021;1(2):150-173.
- Hou J, Yang M, Zhang J. Recent advances in catalysts, electrolytes and electrode engineering for the nitrogen reduction reaction under ambient conditions. *Nanoscale*. 2020;12(13):6900-6920.
- Xu H, Ithisuphalap K, Li Y, et al. Electrochemical ammonia synthesis through N₂ and H₂O under ambient conditions: theory, practices, and challenges for catalysts and electrolytes. *Nano Energy*. 2020;69:104469.
- 57. Guo X, Zhu Y, Ma T. Lowering reaction temperature: electrochemical ammonia synthesis by coupling various electrolytes and catalysts. *J Energy Chem.* 2017;26(6): 1107-1116.

- Chen X, Guo Y, Du X, et al. Atomic structure modification for electrochemical nitrogen reduction to ammonia. *Adv Energy Mater.* 2019;10(3):1903172.
- 59. Yang C, Zhu Y, Liu J, et al. Defect engineering for electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction to ammonia. *Nano Energy*. 2020;77:105126.
- Liu M, Zhang S, Chen M, Wu L. Boosting electrochemical nitrogen reduction performance through water-in-salt electrolyte. *Appl Catal B*. 2022;319:121925.
- Biswas A, Nandi S, Kamboj N, Pan J, Bhowmik A, Dey RS. Alteration of electronic band structure via a metalsemiconductor interfacial effect enables high Faradaic efficiency for electrochemical nitrogen fixation. ACS Nano. 2021;15(12):20364-20376.
- Ge R, Huo J, Sun M, et al. Surface and interface engineering: molybdenum carbide-based nanomaterials for electrochemical energy conversion. *Small.* 2021;17(9):1903380.
- 63. Chen S, Liu X, Xiong J, Mi L, Song X-Z, Li Y. Defect and interface engineering in metal sulfide catalysts for the electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction reaction: a review. *J Mater Chem A*. 2022;10(13):6927-6949.
- Kim D, Alam K, Han MK, et al. Manipulating wettability of catalytic surface for improving ammonia production from electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *J Colloid Interface Sci.* 2023;633:53-59.
- 65. Paul S, Sarkar S, Adalder A, Kapse S, Thapa R, Ghorai UK. Strengthening the metal center of CoN₄ active sites in a 1D-2D heterostructure for nitrate and nitrogen reduction reaction to ammonia. ACS Sustainable Chem Eng. 2023;11(16):6191-6200.
- Zhou J, Chen X, Guo M, Hu W, Huang B, Yuan D. Enhanced catalytic activity of bimetallic ordered catalysts for nitrogen reduction reaction by perturbation of scaling relations. ACS Catal. 2023;13(4):2190-2201.
- Wang X, Luo M, Lan J, Peng M, Tan Y. Nanoporous intermetallic Pd₃Bi for efficient electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *Adv Mater*. 2021;33(18):2007733.
- Zou H, Arachchige LJ, Rong W, et al. Low-valence metal single atoms on graphdiyne promotes electrochemical nitrogen reduction via M-to-N₂ π-backdonation. *Adv Funct Mater*. 2022;32(24):2200333.
- Pu Z, Liu T, Zhang G, et al. Nanostructured metal borides for energy-related electrocatalysis: recent progress, challenges, and perspectives. *Small Methods*. 2021;5(10):2100699.
- Zhao R, Chen Y, Xiang H, et al. Two-dimensional ordered double-transition metal carbides for the electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces. 2023;15(5):6797-6806.
- Wang J, Jiang Z, Peng G, et al. Surface valence state effect of MoO_{2+x} on electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *Adv Sci.* 2022;9(12):2104857.
- 72. Yang X, Xu B, Chen JG, Yang X. Recent progress in electrochemical nitrogen reduction on transition metal nitrides. *ChemSusChem.* 2023;16(5):e202201715.
- Jin H, Kim HS, Lee CH, et al. Directing the surface atomic geometry on copper sulfide for enhanced electrochemical nitrogen reduction. ACS Catal. 2022;12(21):13638-13648.
- 74. Yesudoss DK, Chun H, Han B, Shanmugam S. Accelerated N_2 reduction kinetics in hybrid interfaces of NbTiO₄ and

nitrogen-doped carbon nanorod via synergistic electronic coupling effect. *Appl Catal B.* 2022;304:120938.

- Zhao S, Lu X, Wang L, Gale J, Amal R. Carbon-based metalfree catalysts for electrocatalytic reduction of nitrogen for synthesis of ammonia at ambient conditions. *Adv Mater*. 2019;31(13):1805367.
- Pang J, Chang B, Liu H, Zhou W. Potential of MXene-based heterostructures for energy conversion and storage. ACS Energy Lett. 2021;7(1):78-96.
- 77. Choi J, Suryanto BHR, Wang D, et al. Identification and elimination of false positives in electrochemical nitrogen reduction studies. *Nat Commun.* 2020;11:5546.
- Tang C, Qiao S-Z. True or false in electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *Joule*. 2019;3(7):1573-1575.
- Suryanto BHR, Du H-L, Wang D, Chen J, Simonov AN, MacFarlane DR. Challenges and prospects in the catalysis of electroreduction of nitrogen to ammonia. *Nat Catal.* 2019; 2(4):290-296.
- Tang C, Qiao SZ. How to explore ambient electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction reliably and insightfully. *Chem Soc Rev.* 2019;48(12):3166-3180.
- Guo Y, Wang T, Yang Q, et al. Highly efficient electrochemical reduction of nitrogen to ammonia on surface termination modified Ti₃C₂T_x MXene nanosheets. *ACS Nano*. 2020;14(7):9089-9097.
- Zheng X, Liu Y, Yao Y. Trimetallic single-cluster catalysts for electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction: activity prediction, mechanism, and electronic descriptor. *Chem Eng J.* 2021;426:130745.
- Zou H, Rong W, Wei S, Ji Y, Duan L. Regulating kinetics and thermodynamics of electrochemical nitrogen reduction with metal single-atom catalysts in a pressurized electrolyser. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. 2020;117(47):29462-29468.
- Gu H, Chen W, Li X. Atomically dispersed metal catalysts for the electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction. *J Mater Chem A*. 2022;10(42):22331-22353.
- Cai X, Yang F, An L, et al. Evaluation of electrocatalytic activity of noble metal catalysts toward nitrogen reduction reaction in aqueous solutions under ambient conditions. *ChemSusChem.* 2022;15(1):e202102234.
- Lu L, Zheng H, Li Y, Zhou Y, Fang B. Ligand-free synthesis of noble metal nanocatalysts for electrocatalysis. *Chem Eng J*. 2023;451:138668.
- Kong W, Deng J, Li L. Recent advances in noble metal MXene-based catalysts for electrocatalysis. *J Mater Chem A*. 2022;10(28):14674-14691.
- Liu S, Wang Z, Zhang H, et al. Palladium nanothorn assembly array for efficient electroreduction of nitrogen to ammonia. *ACS Sustainable Chem Eng.* 2020;8(37):14228-14233.
- Du R, Jin X, Hübner R, Fan X, Hu Y, Eychmüller A. Engineering self-supported noble metal foams toward electrocatalysis and beyond. *Adv Energy Mater*. 2019;10(11):1901945.
- Du R, Joswig JO, Hübner R, et al. Freeze-thaw-promoted fabrication of clean and hierarchically structured noble-metal aerogels for electrocatalysis and photoelectrocatalysis. *Angew Chem Int Ed.* 2020;59(21):8293-8300.
- Zhang F, Zhu Y, Lin Q, Zhang L, Zhang X, Wang H. Noblemetal single-atoms in thermocatalysis, electrocatalysis, and photocatalysis. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2021;14(5):2954-3009.

- 92. Gao F, Zhang Y, Wu Z, You H, Du Y. Universal strategies to multi-dimensional noble-metal-based catalysts for electrocatalysis. *Coord Chem Rev.* 2021;436:213825.
- Bao D, Zhang Q, Meng FL, et al. Electrochemical reduction of N₂ under ambient conditions for artificial N₂ fixation and renewable energy storage using N₂/NH₃ cycle. *Adv Mater*. 2017;29(3):1604799.
- Feng C, Wu ZP, Huang KW, Ye J, Zhang H. Surface modification of 2D photocatalysts for solar energy conversion. *Adv Mater.* 2022;34(23):2200180.
- 95. Feng C, Tang L, Deng Y, et al. Synthesis of leaf-vein-like g- C_3N_4 with tunable band structures and charge transfer properties for selective photocatalytic H_2O_2 evolution. *Adv Funct Mater.* 2020;30(39):2001922.
- 96. Wu G, Han X, Cai J, et al. In-plane strain engineering in ultrathin noble metal nanosheets boosts the intrinsic electrocatalytic hydrogen evolution activity. *Nat Commun.* 2022;13:4200.
- 97. Li Y, Guo S. Noble metal-based 1D and 2D electrocatalytic nanomaterials: recent progress, challenges and perspectives. *Nano Today*. 2019;28:100774.
- Yang Y, Luo M, Zhang W, Sun Y, Chen X, Guo S. Metal surface and interface energy electrocatalysis: fundamentals, performance engineering, and opportunities. *Chem.* 2018; 4(9):2054-2083.
- 99. Chen P, Tong Y, Wu C, Xie Y. Surface/interfacial engineering of inorganic low-dimensional electrode materials for electrocatalysis. *Acc Chem Res.* 2018;51(11):2857-2866.
- 100. Cheng H, Ding LX, Chen GF, Zhang L, Xue J, Wang H. Molybdenum carbide nanodots enable efficient electrocatalytic nitrogen fixation under ambient conditions. *Adv Mater*. 2018;30(46):1803694.
- 101. Yin H, Hu J, Fang C, et al. Highly efficient electrocatalytic nitrogen fixation enabled by the bridging effect of Ru in plasmonic nanoparticles. *Nano Res.* 2022;16(1):360-370.
- 102. Yu J, Chang B, Yu W, et al. Chromium phosphide nanoparticles embedded in porous nitrogen-/phosphorusdoped carbon as efficient electrocatalysts for a nitrogen reduction reaction. *Carbon Energy*. 2022;4(2):237-245.
- 103. Tschersich C, Hoof S, Frank N, Herwig C, Limberg C. The effect of substituents at Lewis acidic bismuth(iii) centers on its propensity to bind a noble metal donor. *Inorg Chem.* 2016;55(4):1837-1842.
- 104. Halldin Stenlid J, Johansson AJ, Brinck T. σ -Holes and σ lumps direct the Lewis basic and acidic interactions of noble metal nanoparticles: introducing regium bonds. *Phys Chem Chem Phys.* 2018;20(4):2676-2692.
- 105. Bin C, Yuan H, Li L, et al. Enhancing electrochemical nitrogen fixation by mimicking π back-donation on lasertuned lewis acid sites in noble-metal-molybdenum carbide. *Appl Catal B.* 2023;320:121777.
- 106. Tian Y, Chang B, Wang G, et al. Magnetron sputtering tuned " π back-donation" sites over metal oxides for enhanced electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction. *J Mater Chem A*. 2022;10(6):2800-2806.
- 107. Zhao L, Chang B, Dong T, et al. Laser synthesis of amorphous CoS_x nanospheres for efficient hydrogen evolution and nitrogen reduction reactions. *J Mater Chem A*. 2022;10(37):20071-20079.

- 108. Li J, Chen S, Quan F, et al. Accelerated dinitrogen electroreduction to ammonia via interfacial polarization triggered by single-atom protrusions. *Chem.* 2020;6(4): 885-901.
- 109. Yuan C, Wu HB, Xie Y, Lou XW. Mixed transition-metal oxides: design, synthesis, and energy-related applications. *Angew Chem Int Ed.* 2014;53(6):1488-1504.
- 110. Maduraiveeran G, Sasidharan M, Jin W. Earth-abundant transition metal and metal oxide nanomaterials: synthesis and electrochemical applications. *Prog Mater Sci.* 2019;106: 100574.
- Huang Y, Babu DD, Peng Z, Wang Y. Atomic modulation, structural design, and systematic optimization for efficient electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *Adv Sci.* 2020;7(4): 1902390.
- 112. Chang B, Deng L, Wang S, et al. A vanadium-nickel oxynitride layer for enhanced electrocatalytic nitrogen fixation in neutral media. *J Mater Chem A*. 2020;8(1):91-96.
- 113. Jin H, Li L, Liu X, et al. Nitrogen vacancies on 2D layered W_2N_3 : a stable and efficient active site for nitrogen reduction reaction. *Adv Mater*. 2019;31(32):1902709.
- 114. Wang H, Li J, Li K, et al. Transition metal nitrides for electrochemical energy applications. *Chem Soc Rev.* 2021;50(2): 1354-1390.
- 115. Xue Z-H, Luan D, Zhang H, (David) Lou XW. Single-atom catalysts for photocatalytic energy conversion. *Joule*. 2022; 6(1):92-133.
- 116. Liu C, Li Q, Wu C, et al. Single-boron catalysts for nitrogen reduction reaction. *J Am Chem Soc.* 2019;141(7):2884-2888.
- 117. Liu X, Jiao Y, Zheng Y, Jaroniec M, Qiao SZ. Building up a picture of the electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction activity of transition metal single-atom catalysts. J Am Chem Soc. 2019;141(24):9664-9672.
- 118. Gu Y, Xi B, Tian W, Zhang H, Fu Q, Xiong S. Boosting selective nitrogen reduction via geometric coordination engineering on single-tungsten-atom catalysts. *Adv Mater*. 2021;33(25):2100429.
- 119. Li S, Lin J, Chang B, et al. Implanting single-atom N₂-Fe-B₂ catalytic sites in carbon hosts to stabilize high-loading and lean-electrolyte lithium-sulfur batteries. *Energy Storage Mater*. 2023;55:94-104.
- 120. Li X, Xu W, Fang Y, et al. Single-atom catalyst application in distributed renewable energy conversion and storage. *SusMat.* 2023;3(2):160-179.
- 121. Huang J, Zhang Q, Ding J, Zhai Y. Fe–N–C single atom catalysts for the electrochemical conversion of carbon, nitrogen and oxygen elements. *Mater Rep Energy*. 2022;2(3): 100141.
- Song Z, Zhang L, Doyle-Davis K, Fu X, Luo JL, Sun X. Recent advances in MOF-derived single atom catalysts for electrochemical applications. *Adv Energy Mater.* 2020;10(38): 2001561.
- 123. Iqbal MS, Yao Z-B, Ruan Y-K, et al. Single-atom catalysts for electrochemical N_2 reduction to NH_3 . *Rare Met.* 2023;42(4): 1075-1097.
- 124. Li X, Liu L, Ren X, Gao J, Huang Y, Liu B. Microenvironment modulation of single-atom catalysts and their roles in electrochemical energy conversion. *Sci Adv.* 2020;6(39): eabb6833.

23 of 27

- 125. Ma Y, Yang T, Zou H, et al. Synergizing mo single atoms and Mo_2c nanoparticles on cnts synchronizes selectivity and activity of electrocatalytic N_2 reduction to ammonia. Adv Mater. 2020;32(33):2002177.
- 126. Zhao Y, Zhang J, Guo X, et al. Engineering strategies and active site identification of MXene-based catalysts for electrochemical conversion reactions. *Chem Soc Rev.* 2023;52(9): 3215-3264.
- 127. Johnson D, Djire A. Effect of pH on the electrochemical behavior and nitrogen reduction reaction activity of Ti_2N nitride mxene. *Adv Mater Interfaces*. 2023;10(10):2202147.
- Gao Y, Cao Y, Zhuo H, et al. Mo₂TiC₂ MXene: a promising catalyst for electrocatalytic ammonia synthesis. *Catal Today*. 2020;339:120-126.
- 129. Johnson LR, Sridhar S, Zhang L, et al. MXene materials for the electrochemical nitrogen reduction-functionalized or not? *ACS Catal.* 2019;10(1):253-264.
- 130. Sun J, Kong W, Jin Z, et al. Recent advances of MXene as promising catalysts for electrochemical nitrogen reduction reaction. *Chin Chem Lett.* 2020;31(4):953-960.
- Song HC, Ham HC. On the role of metal cation in MXene in boosting the catalytic activity of single/double atom toward electrochemical NH₃ production. *Chem Eng J.* 2023;470: 144243.
- 132. Cai J, Huang J, Cao A, et al. Interfacial hydrogen bondinginvolved electrocatalytic ammonia synthesis on OHterminated mxene. *Appl Catal B*. 2023;328:122473.
- Cheng Y, Li X, Shen P, Guo Y, Chu K. Mxene quantum dots/ copper nanocomposites for synergistically enhanced N₂ electroreduction. *Energy Environ Mater.* 2022;6(1):12268.
- 134. He H, Wen HM, Li HK, et al. Hydrophobicity tailoring of ferric covalent organic framework/MXene nanosheets for high-efficiency nitrogen electroreduction to ammonia. *Adv Sci.* 2023;10(15):2206933.
- 135. Fang QJ, Zhang W, Zhang X, et al. Rational design of bimetallic MXene solid solution with high-performance electrocatalytic n₂ reduction. *J Colloid Interface Sci.* 2023;640: 67-77.
- 136. Peng W, Luo M, Xu X, et al. Spontaneous atomic ruthenium doping in Mo_2CT_x MXene defects enhances electrocatalytic activity for the nitrogen reduction reaction. *Adv Energy Mater.* 2020;10(25):2001364.
- 137. Jiang H, Shi D, Sun X, et al. Boron carbonitride lithium-ion capacitors with an electrostatically expanded operating voltage window. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces. 2020;12(42): 47425-47434.
- Paul R, Zhu L, Chen H, Qu J, Dai L. Recent advances in carbonbased metal-free electrocatalysts. *Adv Mater*. 2019;31(31): 1806403.
- 139. Feng C, Tang L, Deng Y, et al. A novel sulfur-assisted annealing method of $g-C_3N_4$ nanosheet compensates for the loss of light absorption with further promoted charge transfer for photocatalytic production of H₂ and H₂O₂. *Appl Catal B.* 2021;281:119539.
- 140. Wen Y, Zhu H, Hao J, et al. Metal-free boron and sulphur Codoped carbon nanofibers with optimized p-band centers for highly efficient nitrogen electroreduction to ammonia. *Appl Catal B.* 2021;292:120144.

- 141. Li Y, Gao D, Zhao S, et al. Carbon doped hexagonal boron nitride nanoribbon as efficient metal-free electrochemical nitrogen reduction catalyst. *Chem Eng J.* 2021;410:128419.
- 142. Xu T, Ma B, Liang J, et al. Recent progress in metal-free electrocatalysts toward ambient N_2 reduction reaction. Acta Phys Chim Sin. 2021;37(7):2009043.
- Li L, Tang C, Jin H, Davey K, Qiao S-Z. Main-group elements boost electrochemical nitrogen fixation. *Chem.* 2021;7(12): 3232-3255.
- 144. Wang B, Liu B, Dai L. Non-N-doped carbons as metal-free electrocatalysts. *Adv Sustainable Syst.* 2020;5(1):2000134.
- 145. Hu C, Gao Y, Zhao L, Dai L. Carbon-based metal-free electrocatalysts: recent progress and forward looking. *Chem Catal*. 2022;2(9):2150-2156.
- 146. Zhai Q, Pan Y, Dai L. Carbon-based metal-free electrocatalysts: past, present, and future. *Acc Mater Res.* 2021;2(12): 1239-1250.
- Lv C, Jia N, Qian Y, et al. Ammonia electrosynthesis with a stable metal-free 2D silicon phosphide catalyst. *Small*. 2023;19(10):2205959.
- 148. Lan J, Luo M, Han J, Peng M, Duan H, Tan Y. Nanoporous $B_{13}C_2$ towards highly efficient electrochemical nitrogen fixation. *Small.* 2021;17(39):2102814.
- 149. Tang M, Jiang X, He M, Jiang N, Zheng Q, Lin D. B (boron), O (oxygen) dual-doped carbon spheres as a high-efficiency electrocatalyst for nitrogen reduction. *Int J Hydrogen Energy*. 2021;46(1):439-448.
- 150. Zhang W, Mao K, Low J, et al. Working-in-tandem mechanism of multi-dopants in enhancing electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction reaction performance of carbon-based materials. *Nano Res.* 2021;14(9):3234-3239.
- 151. Chang B, Li L, Shi D, et al. Metal-free boron carbonitride with tunable boron Lewis acid sites for enhanced nitrogen electroreduction to ammonia. *Appl Catal B*. 2021;283:119622.
- 152. Ma C, Zhang Y, Yan S, Liu B. Carbon-doped boron nitride nanosheets: a high-efficient electrocatalyst for ambient nitrogen reduction. *Appl Catal B*. 2022;315:121574.
- Zhang W, Zhan S, Qin Q, et al. Electrochemical generation of catalytically active edge sites in C₂N-type carbon materials for artificial nitrogen fixation. *Small.* 2022;18(42):2204116.
- 154. Kong Y, Li Y, Sang X, et al. Atomically dispersed zinc(i) active sites to accelerate nitrogen reduction kinetics for ammonia electrosynthesis. *Adv Mater.* 2022;34(2):2103548.
- 155. Liu P-Y, Shi K, Chen W-Z, et al. Enhanced electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction reaction performance by interfacial engineering of MOF-based sulfides FeNi₂S₄/NiS hetero-interface. *Appl Catal B.* 2021;287:119956.
- 156. Zhang L, Ding LX, Chen GF, Yang X, Wang H. Ammonia synthesis under ambient conditions: selective electroreduction of dinitrogen to ammonia on black phosphorus nanosheets. *Angew Chem.* 2019;131(9):2638-2642.
- 157. Li L, Tang C, Yao D, Zheng Y, Qiao S-Z. Electrochemical nitrogen reduction: identification and elimination of contamination in electrolyte. *ACS Energy Lett.* 2019;4(9): 2111-2116.
- 158. Hodgetts RY, Du HL, MacFarlane DR, Simonov AN. Electrochemically induced generation of extraneous nitrite and ammonia in organic electrolyte solutions during

CARBON ENERGY-WILEY

nitrogen reduction experiments. *ChemElectroChem.* 2021; 8(9):1596-1604.

- 159. Sheets BL, Botte GG. Electrochemical nitrogen reduction to ammonia under mild conditions enabled by a polymer gel electrolyte. *Chem Commun.* 2018;54(34):4250-4253.
- 160. Fan G, Xu W, Li J, et al. Enhancing electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction on few-layer antimonene in an aqueous potassium sulfate electrolyte. *J Phys Chem C*. 2022;126(32):13629-13639.
- 161. Blair SJ, Doucet M, Browning JF, et al. Lithium-mediated electrochemical nitrogen reduction: tracking electrodeelectrolyte interfaces via time-resolved neutron reflectometry. *ACS Energy Lett.* 2022;7(6):1939-1946.
- 162. Zhou F, Azofra LM, Ali M, et al. Electro-synthesis of ammonia from nitrogen at ambient temperature and pressure in ionic liquids. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2017;10(12): 2516-2520.
- 163. Mao H, Fu Y, Yang H, et al. Ultrathin 1T-MoS₂ nanoplates induced by quaternary ammonium-type ionic liquids on polypyrrole/graphene oxide nanosheets and its irreversible crystal phase transition during electrocatalytic nitrogen reduction. ACS Appl Mater Interfaces. 2020;12(22):25189-25199.
- 164. Licht S, Cui B, Wang B, Li FF, Lau J, Liu S. Ammonia synthesis by N_2 and steam electrolysis in molten hydroxide suspensions of nanoscale Fe₂O₃. *Science*. 2014;345(6197): 637-640.
- Garagounis I, Kyriakou V, Skodra A, Vasileiou E, Stoukides M. Electrochemical synthesis of ammonia in solid electrolyte cells. *Front Energy Res.* 2014;2:1-10.
- 166. Li S, Zhou Y, Li K, et al. Electrosynthesis of ammonia with high selectivity and high rates via engineering of the solid-electrolyte interphase. *Joule*. 2022;6(9):2083-2101.
- Chen Y, Gu S, Li W. Solid-electrolyte interphases enable efficient Li-mediated ammonia electrosynthesis. *Joule.* 2022;6(9): 1973-1976.
- 168. Lan R, Tao S. Electrochemical synthesis of ammonia directly from air and water using a Li⁺/H⁺/NH₄⁺ mixed conducting electrolyte. *RSC Adv.* 2013;3(39):18016-18021.
- 169. Huang D, Han Y, Wu F, Wang H. Intermediate temperature electrochemical properties of lutetium-doped SrCeO₃/ SrZrO₃-molten carbonate composite electrolyte. *Ceram Int.* 2019;45(8):10149-10153.
- 170. Bagryantseva IN, Ponomareva VG, Lazareva NP. Protonconductive membranes based on CsH_2PO_4 and ultradispersed polytetrafluoroethylene. *Solid State Ion.* 2019;329: 61-66.
- Chanda D, Xing R, Xu T, et al. Electrochemical nitrogen reduction: recent progress and prospects. *Chem Commun.* 2021;57(60):7335-7349.
- 172. Shahid UB, Chen Y, Gu S, Li W, Shao M. Electrochemical nitrogen reduction: an intriguing but challenging quest. *Trends Chem.* 2022;4(2):142-156.
- 173. Kolen M, Ripepi D, Smith WA, Burdyny T, Mulder FM. Overcoming nitrogen reduction to ammonia detection challenges: the case for leapfrogging to gas diffusion electrode platforms. *ACS Catal.* 2022;12(10):5726-5735.
- 174. Dong F, Wu M, Chen Z, et al. Atomically dispersed transition metal-nitrogen-carbon bifunctional oxygen electrocatalysts for zinc–air batteries: recent advances and future perspectives. *Nano-Micro Lett.* 2021;14(1):36.

- 175. Glibin VP, Dodelet JP, Zhang G. Energetics and thermodynamic stability of potential Fe(ii)-hexa-aza-active sites for O₂ reduction in PEM fuel cells. *SusMat.* 2022;2(6):731-748.
- 176. Shi Y, Wang Y, Yu J, et al. Superscalar phase boundaries derived multiple active sites in $SnO_2/Cu_6Sn_5/CuO$ for tandem electroreduction of CO_2 to formic acid. *Adv Energy Mater.* 2023;13(13):2203506.
- 177. Andersen SZ, Statt MJ, Bukas VJ, et al. Increasing stability, efficiency, and fundamental understanding of lithium-mediated electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2020;13(11):4291-4300.
- 178. Lazouski N, Schiffer ZJ, Williams K, Manthiram K. Understanding continuous lithium-mediated electrochemical nitrogen reduction. *Joule*. 2019;3(4):1127-1139.
- 179. Chalkley MJ, Drover MW, Peters JC. Catalytic N_2 -to- NH_3 (or $-N_2H_4$) conversion by well-defined molecular coordination complexes. *Chem Rev.* 2020;120(12):5582-5636.
- Foster SL, Bakovic SIP, Duda RD, et al. Catalysts for nitrogen reduction to ammonia. *Nat Catal.* 2018;1(7):490-500.
- 181. Lazouski N, Steinberg KJ, Gala ML, Krishnamurthy D, Viswanathan V, Manthiram K. Proton donors induce a differential transport effect for selectivity toward ammonia in lithium-mediated nitrogen reduction. ACS Catal. 2022;12(9): 5197-5208.
- 182. Jiang H, Chen G-F, Savateev O, Wang H. Visualizing the reaction interface of lithium-mediated nitrogen fixation. *Joule*. 2023;7(2):253-256.
- 183. Du H-L, Matuszek K, Hodgetts RY, et al. The chemistry of proton carriers in high-performance lithium-mediated ammonia electrosynthesis. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2023;16(3): 1082-1090.
- 184. Westhead O, Spry M, Bagger A, et al. The role of ion solvation in lithium mediated nitrogen reduction. J Mater Chem A. 2023;11(24):12746-12758.
- 185. Steinberg K, Yuan X, Klein CK, et al. Imaging of nitrogen fixation at lithium solid electrolyte interphases via cryoelectron microscopy. *Nat Energy*. 2022;8(2):138-148.
- 186. Suryanto BHR, Matuszek K, Choi J, et al. Nitrogen reduction to ammonia at high efficiency and rates based on a phosphonium proton shuttle. *Science*. 2021;372(6547): 1187-1191.
- Du HL, Chatti M, Hodgetts RY, et al. Electroreduction of nitrogen with almost 100% current-to-ammonia efficiency. *Nature*. 2022;609(7928):722-727.
- Krishnamurthy D, Lazouski N, Gala ML, Manthiram K, Viswanathan V. Closed-loop electrolyte design for lithiummediated ammonia synthesis. ACS Cent Sci. 2021;7(12): 2073-2082.
- Westhead O, Jervis R, Stephens IEL. Is lithium the key for nitrogen electroreduction? *Science*. 2021;372(6547): 1149-1150.
- Li K, Andersen SZ, Statt MJ, et al. Enhancement of lithiummediated ammonia synthesis by addition of oxygen. *Science*. 2021;374(6575):1593-1597.
- 191. Fu X, Pedersen JB, Zhou Y, et al. Continuous-flow electrosynthesis of ammonia by nitrogen reduction and hydrogen oxidation. *Science*. 2023;379(6633):707-712.
- 192. Shaver MP, Fryzuk MD. Activation of molecular nitrogen: coordination, cleavage and functionalization of N_2 mediated

26 of 27

by metal complexes. *Adv Synth Catal.* 2003;345(910): 1061-1076.

- 193. Chalkley MJ, Del Castillo TJ, Matson BD, Peters JC. Femediated nitrogen fixation with a metallocene mediator: exploring pka effects and demonstrating electrocatalysis. *J Am Chem Soc.* 2018;140(19):6122-6129.
- 194. Huang W, Peng LY, Zhang J, et al. Vanadium-catalyzed dinitrogen reduction to ammonia via a [V]=NNH₂ intermediate. *J Am Chem Soc.* 2023;145(2):811-821.
- 195. Garrido-Barros P, Derosa J, Chalkley MJ, Peters JC. Tandem electrocatalytic N_2 fixation via proton-coupled electron transfer. *Nature*. 2022;609(7925):71-76.
- 196. Threatt SD, Rees DC. Biological nitrogen fixation in theory, practice, and reality: a perspective on the molybdenum nitrogenase system. *FEBS Lett.* 2023;597(1):45-58.
- 197. Demtröder L, Narberhaus F, Masepohl B. Coordinated regulation of nitrogen fixation and molybdate transport by molybdenum. *Mol Microbiol.* 2019;111(1):17-30.
- 198. Ma J, Song Z, Zhou Y, Han H. Iron-molybdenum quantum dots for enhancing the nitrogenase activity of nodules. *ACS Appl Nano Mater*. 2022;5(11):16694-16705.
- 199. Buscagan TM, Oyala PH, Peters JC. N_2 -to- NH_3 conversion by a triphos-iron catalyst and enhanced turnover under photolysis. *Angew Chem Int Ed.* 2017;56(24):6921-6926.
- Addo MA, Dos Santos PC. Distribution of nitrogen-fixation genes in prokaryotes containing alternative nitrogenases. *ChemBioChem*. 2020;21(12):1749-1759.
- 201. Milton RD, Abdellaoui S, Khadka N, et al. Nitrogenase bioelectrocatalysis: heterogeneous ammonia and hydrogen production by MoFe protein. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2016;9(8): 2550-2554.
- 202. Söderberg O, Gullberg M, Jarvius M, et al. Direct observation of individual endogenous protein complexes in situ by proximity ligation. *Nat Methods*. 2006;3(12):995-1000.
- 203. Liu C, Sakimoto KK, Colón BC, Silver PA, Nocera DG. Ambient nitrogen reduction cycle using a hybrid inorganic-biological system. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA*. 2017;114(25):6450-6455.
- 204. Wang Y, Wang C, Li M, Yu Y, Zhang B. Nitrate electroreduction: mechanism insight, in situ characterization, performance evaluation, and challenges. *Chem Soc Rev.* 2021;50(12):6720-6733.
- 205. Li Y, Wu T, Wang YJ, et al. Green and large-scale production of ammonia: Laser-driven pyrolysis of nitrogen-enriched biomass. *SusMat.* 2023;3(4):533-542.
- 206. Chen G-F, Yuan Y, Jiang H, et al. Electrochemical reduction of nitrate to ammonia via direct eight-electron transfer using a copper-molecular solid catalyst. *Nat Energy.* 2020;5(8): 605-613.
- 207. Wu T, Chang B, Li Y, et al. Laser-induced plasma and local temperature field for high-efficiency ammonia synthesis. *Nano Energy.* 2023;116:108855.
- 208. Peng P, Schiappacasse C, Zhou N, et al. Sustainable nonthermal plasma-assisted nitrogen fixation-synergistic catalysis. *ChemSusChem*. 2019;12(16):3702-3712.
- 209. Winter LR, Chen JG. N₂ fixation by plasma-activated processes. *Joule*. 2021;5(2):300-315.
- 210. Zhou J, Wei T, An X. Combining non-thermal plasma technology with photocatalysis: a critical review. *Phys Chem Chem Phys.* 2023;25(3):1538-1545.

- 211. Zhang Y, Rawat RS, Fan HJ. Plasma for rapid conversion reactions and surface modification of electrode materials. *Small Methods*. 2017;1(9):0.
- 212. Dou S, Tao L, Wang R, El Hankari S, Chen R, Wang S. Plasmaassisted synthesis and surface modification of electrode materials for renewable energy. *Adv Mater.* 2018;30(21): 1705850.
- 213. Sun J, Alam D, Daiyan R, et al. A hybrid plasma electrocatalytic process for sustainable ammonia production. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2021;14(2):865-872.
- 214. Zeng Y, Priest C, Wang G, Wu G. Restoring the nitrogen cycle by electrochemical reduction of nitrate: progress and prospects. *Small Methods*. 2020;4(12):2000672.
- 215. Fan K, Xie W, Li J, et al. Active hydrogen boosts electrochemical nitrate reduction to ammonia. *Nat Commun.* 2022;13:7958.
- 216. Ge ZX, Wang TJ, Ding Y, et al. Interfacial engineering enhances the electroactivity of frame-like concave RhCu bimetallic nanocubes for nitrate reduction. *Adv Energy Mater.* 2022;12(15):2103916.
- 217. Ren Y, Yu C, Wang L, et al. Microscopic-level insights into the mechanism of enhanced NH_3 synthesis in plasmaenabled cascade N_2 oxidation-electroreduction system. *J Am Chem Soc.* 2022;144(23):10193-10200.
- 218. Han K, Luo J, Feng Y, et al. Wind-driven radial-engineshaped triboelectric nanogenerators for self-powered absorption and degradation of NO_x . *ACS Nano.* 2020;14(3): 2751-2759.
- 219. Zhou D, Zhou R, Zhou R, et al. Sustainable ammonia production by non-thermal plasmas: status, mechanisms, and opportunities. *Chem Eng J.* 2021;421:129544.
- 220. Miao Y, Yokochi A, Jovanovic G, Zhang S, von Jouanne A. Application-oriented non-thermal plasma in chemical reaction engineering: a review. *Green Energy Resour.* 2023; 1(1):100004.
- 221. Xu G, Li X, Xia X, Fu J, Ding W, Zi Y. On the force and energy conversion in triboelectric nanogenerators. *Nano Energy*. 2019;59:154-161.
- 222. Wei X, Zhao Z, Wang L, et al. Energy conversion system based on curie effect and triboelectric nanogenerator for low-grade heat energy harvesting. *Nano Energy*. 2022;91:106652.
- 223. Han K, Luo J, Feng Y, Xu L, Tang W, Wang ZL. Self-powered electrocatalytic ammonia synthesis directly from air as driven by dual triboelectric nanogenerators. *Energy Environ Sci.* 2020;13(8):2450-2458.

AUTHOR BIOGRAPHIES



Bin Chang received his PhD degree from Shandong University in 2020. Then, he worked as a postdoc under the supervision of Prof. Weijia Zhou at the University of Jinan (UJN) and Prof. Shuhui Sun at the Institut National de

la Recherche Scientifique (INRS). He is currently a postdoctoral fellow in Huabin Zhang's group at KAUST Catalysis Center, King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST). His research interests focus on advanced catalysts for electrochemical energy conversion.



Huabin Zhang received his PhD degree in chemistry from Fujian Institute of Research on the Structure of Matter, Chinese Academy of Sciences (FJIRSM-CAS). After finishing his postdoc research in Japan (Supervisor: Jinhua

Ye) at the National Institute of Materials Science (NIMS) and Singapore (supervisor: Xiong Wen Lou) at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore, he joined KAUST serving as an assistant professor in January 2021. His research interests focus on advanced catalysis for sustainable energy.



Shuhui Sun is a full professor at the Institut National de la Recherche Scientifique (INRS), Center for Energy, Materials, and Telecommunications, Canada. He is a Fellow of the Canadian Academy of Engineering (FCAE) and a member of

the Royal Society of Canada (RSC College). His current research interests focus on multifunctional nanomaterials for energy conversion and storage applications, including fuel cells, Li-metal batteries, metal-air batteries, Li-/Na-/Zn-ion batteries, H₂ production, and CO₂ reduction. He is the vice president **CARBON ENERGY-**WILEY

of the International Academy of Electrochemical Energy Science (IAOEES). He serves as the executive editor-in-chief of *Electrochemical Energy Reviews* (EER) and associate editor of *SusMat*, as well as the editorial board member of over 10 journals related to nanomaterials and sustainable energy.



Gaixia Zhang is a Marcelle-Gauvreau Engineering Research Chair Professor at École de Technologie Supérieure (ÉTS), University of Quebec, Montréal, Canada. She received her Ph.D. degree from Polytechnique Montréal and then con-

27 of 27

tinued her research at Western University and INRS, Canada. Her research interests focus on advanced materials (catalysts, electrodes, and electrolytes) for sustainable energy conversion and storage applications, including fuel cells, batteries, hydrogen production, and CO_2 reduction. She is also interested in interface and device engineering, as well as in situ characterizations and theoretical simulations.

How to cite this article: Chang B, Zhang H, Sun S, Zhang G. Strategies to achieve effective nitrogen activation. *Carbon Energy.* 2024;e491. doi:10.1002/cey2.491